



The Possibilities for Interreligious Dialogues on Ecology in Indonesia

A Literature Review

Daan van der Leij

CRCS

THE POSSIBILITIES FOR INTERRELIGIOUS DIALOGUES ON ECOLOGY IN INDONESIA

A Literature Review

Daan van der Leij

CRC

The Possibilities for Interreligious Dialogues on Ecology in Indonesia: a Literature Review

© November 2021

by Daan van der Leij

Editor M. Iqbal Ahnaf

Proofreader Budi Ashari

Illustrator and Designer M Rizal Abdi

viii & 98 pages ; 15 x 23 cm

First edition, November 2021

ISBN: 978-623-7289-13-5

Center for Religious and Cross-cultural Studies, CRCS

Graduate School, Universitas Gadjah Mada

Jl. Teknika Utara, Pogung, Yogyakarta

Telp/Fax: 0274 544976 | Email: crcs@ugm.ac.id

crcs.ugm.ac.id

FOREWORD

THE discourse on religion and ecology is growing rapidly for the last two decades. There are at least two main issues in this thriving discourse: first, the responsibility of religion to the environmental crisis; second, how religion or religious institution respond or play a role in overcoming the ecological crisis. In the context of Indonesia, the role of religion in overcoming the environmental crisis is vital. Not only because of Indonesia's environmental conditions that are prone to ecological disasters, but also the role of religious institutions that are so influential in this country. Religion occupies a central topic within the public debates in Indonesia, environmental challenges in Indonesia is no exception. Many religious leaders are for instance involved with protecting their environment. This response could be considered as a form of responsibility towards preservation of nature and the environment.

The literature review conducted by Daan is written in this context, namely how religion and interreligious dialogue in Indonesia respond to the ecological crisis surround it. Daan describes the basic scientific concepts of ecology as

it relates to social and cultural theory. This concept is a framework for seeing how ecological issues become the main issue in interreligious relations or dialogue in Indonesia. For extend, the framework help us to have better understanding on how religious values can be relevant to advocate against the current environmental issues in Indonesia.

Furthermore, through reading many literatures and news reports, Daan investigates more deeply about the various programs and activities carried out by religious organizations in Indonesia, including indigenous religions: What and how do these religious institutions initiate, either individually or in inter-institutional cooperation, in responding to Indonesia's ecological conditions? In fact, the issue of ecology has sparked many parties to discuss further in the practical level. For example, Daan pointed out that several enterprises, government, educational institution, as well as NGO have also been actively involved in this issue.

This work is an important contribution to academics, especially in the field of religious studies, as well as practitioners of ecology. On the one hand, this book can be used as material in exploring the area of religious and ecological studies in the study of interreligious dialogue. Moreover, this book might becomes a basis for designing an ecological program that is linked to religion.

October 2021

CRCS UGM

CONTENTS

Forewordv

Contents vii

01. Introduction..... 1

1.1 Motivation 1

1.2 Methodology and Limitations3

1.3 Outline of the Review5

2.1 Introduction..... 7

2.2 Definition of Religion..... 7

02. Religion in the Indonesian Context 7

2.3 Function of Religion 9

2.4 Religion and Social Capital10

2.5 Religion in the Indonesian Public Sphere..... 13

03. Interreligious Dialogue within the Ecological Discourse 16

3.1 Introduction..... 16

3.2 Ecology..... 16

3.3 Interreligious Dialogue..... 17

3.4 Social Capital and Interreligious Dialogue 20

3.5 Consensus and Interreligious Dialogue 22

04. Examples of Religion in the Ecological Discourse in Indonesia25

4.1 Introduction 25

4.2 Islam and Ecology 25

4.3 Eco-Islam and Interreligious Dialogue 29

4.4 Christianity and Ecology..... 30

4.5 Eco-Christianity and Interreligious Dialogue 34

4.6 Hinduism, Buddhism, Confucianism and Ecology 35

4.7 Hinduism, Buddhism, Confucianism, and Interreligious Dialogue 41

4.8 Indigenous Religion and Ecology..... 42

4.9 Indigenous Religion and Interreligious Dialogue 45

05. The Possibilities for the Public Sphere47

5.1 Introduction.....47

5.2 Faith-Based Organizations47

5.3 Non-Governmental Organizations..... 51

5.4 Businesses..... 53

5.5 Government 55

Conclusion57

Recommendations 59

Bibliography..... 62

01. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Motivation

THIS literature review is written to better understand how religious values can be relevant to advocate against the current environmental issues in Indonesia. There are number of articles and books written about this topic, but until now there is not that much written about the practical implication of these topics for the Indonesian society. This literature review addresses those practical implications to further strengthen the public discourse on the environment.

This literature review fills in the gap of the lack an all-inclusive review related to this topic. This is quite strange since it is important to fully understand and participate in the public discourse on the environmental issues in Indonesia. Religion is still a very big part of the Indonesian society. Ismatu Ropi, an author on the public policy in Indonesia, stated, for example, that religion and the Indonesian state are closely connected to the way the government regulates

their policies.¹ This can be seen in how the constitution and the state philosophy (Pancasila), were written. Both state declarations show that religion is an important part for the Indonesian society. This is because both declarations state that the Indonesian society should be based around the religious identity in Indonesia. Zainal Abidin Bagir also recounts the importance of religion for the public sphere in Indonesia in his work called “*The Importance of Religion and Ecology in Indonesia*”. In this article he shows how religion and ecology are intertwined in Indonesia through the way religion is used in the public debates in Indonesia, due to its importance in many sectors of life in Indonesia.²

The second reason for this review is that the possibilities for an interreligious cooperation is also not fully explored in previous literature about the environmental issues in Indonesia. This can be seen in how little there has been written on communities and organisations with different religious backgrounds that work together to further strengthen their positions in the public discourse on environmental issues. This is surprising since the current international discourse on environmental issues is strongly based on cooperation. There are, for instance, a lot of international agreements signed by many countries on climate change. An example of this is, of course the *Paris Agreement* in which almost

1 Ismatu Ropi, *Religion and Regulation in Indonesia* (Singapore: Palgrave Macmillan, 2017), 15. <https://www.palgrave.com/gp/book/9789811028267>.

2 Zainal Abidin Bagir, “The Importance of Religion and Ecology in Indonesia”, *Worldviews: Global Religions, Culture, and Ecology*, 19, no. 2 (2015):99.

every member of the United Nations (UN) agreed to make policies and legislation to reduce global warming.³ Indonesia also signed this agreement and, therefore, made a promise to the international community to reduce greenhouse gasses. But the hands-on approach of these agreements until now has not yet fully been interconnected with religion. This is unfortunate since religion plays a major role for many people in how they interact with nature and behave in relationship with each other. Religion often plays a role in the way how people observe nature and can, therefore, be an important influencer for promoting ecological values.

This literature review explores these possibilities with the help of examples of cases in Indonesia where interreligious communities or organisations work together. A better understanding of this is important to fully understand the relationship between the public sphere in Indonesia and the ecological discourses on the environment. The environmental issues in the world have gained a growing interest among scholars and policymakers alike who seek a good understanding of the intrinsic values of people in every society, including that of Indonesia, to further improve this discourse. This literature review is, therefore, not only focusing on the implications of this knowledge for scholars and practitioners of religion and ecology, but also on the practical possibilities for non-governmental organizations (NGO's), businesses, government agencies, and faith-based

3 “The Paris Agreement,” United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, last modified October 22, 2018, <https://unfccc.int/process-and-meetings/the-paris-agreement/the-paris-agreement>.

organisations (FBOs). The main question addressed in this literature review is: *what are the opportunities for an interreligious dialogue on ecology in Indonesia?*

1.2 Methodology and Limitations

The main question of this literature review is answered with the help of a literature study and expert-interviews with six experts in the field of religion and ecology. This is done in order to fully understand the background of the ecological discourse. The literature for this comes from fields ranging from sociology, psychology, religious studies, anthropology, to theology. Most of the literature used for this review are, however, based upon bioethics and deep ecology due to their description of the religious ethics and views that are being use within ecological discourses. Which is especially important to answer the main question of this review.

In the first three chapters of this review build the theoretical framework for the last chapter on the possibilities for the public sphere. This is done not only through reviews of many academic publications on the relationship between religion and the ecological discourse Additionally, but this review also looks at sociological publications on religion and the public sphere, news articles on ecological discourses in Indonesia, and internet searches on environmental groups in Indonesia, such as non-governmental organizations (NGO's) and faith based organizations (FBO's). Most of these articles are in English, but there are also a couple of Indonesian news articles used as an example in this review. This is of course

also a limitation of this review, since this review can miss some Indonesian cases that were written in Indonesian.

This literature review, furthermore, combines a literature study and expert-interviews in Chapter 4 on the possibilities for the public sphere based on interviews with six Indonesian experts to explore how the public sphere can benefit from an interreligious dialogue on the ecological issues. These experts are graduates and lecturers of the *Centre for Religious and Cross-cultural Studies* (CRCS), Universitas Gadjah Mada, who have research experience on religion and ecology that wrote at least one paper on this topic. The experts were furthermore Indonesian citizens that had submitted a paper to CRCS for a publication on religion and ecology in Indonesia. Most of the experts are also involved within their own research and participated into one or more initiatives surrounding the current environmental issues. A couple of the interviewed experts are also members of one of the Indonesian main Muslim faith-based organisations, Muhammadiyah and Nahdlatul Ulama. For comparison reasons, there was also one protestant lecturer of theology and preacher of a local church in Yogyakarta interviewed for this review. However due to privacy limitations the names of the experts are not identified in this review.

The experts who participated in the expert-interviews were asked about how a specific religious group, like for example Muslims or Christians, in Indonesia use interreligious dialogues on ecology in the cases that these experts are studying. These scholars and alumni were

moreover also interviewed about how religions interact in the Indonesian society and the advantages/disadvantages that they see in an interreligious dialogue on ecological issues. The interviewees, furthermore, addressed the issue of the possibilities for interreligious dialogues at faith-based organization (FBO's), NGO's, businesses, and the government. The interviews were conducted in English due to language limitations of the researcher. This is, of course, also one of the limitations of this review.

The interviews were later transcribed into an edited transcription, so that only the most useful information of the interviews was shown from the interview. The transcriptions of the expert-interviews were analysed with *Atlas.ti*, a qualitative data analysis program that help making analytical comparison of different opinions on a topic. The *Atlas.ti* analysis is done by structuring every useful paraphrased part in the interview into labels from different topics, with the help of keywords, issues, and themes that were discussed in the interviews. These labelled paraphrased parts are then linked to the related topics of the interview. This was done to show which different actors play a role in the ecological discourse. The paraphrased parts also give background information in Chapter 4 to show the level of trust of the experts in interreligious initiatives on this topic.

This program solves the practical limitations, such as the limited time for this review and limited availability of the respondents to this topic, in addition to language limitations. Therefore, not all points of views could be adopted into this

literature review. The review is, furthermore, limited due to how not all present literature on the ecological discourse in Indonesia could be used for this review. Therefore, the Chapter 4 on *Examples of Religion in the Ecological Discourse in Indonesia* provides less information on other religions such as Hinduism, Buddhism, and Confucianism compared to the sources from Islam.

1.3 Outline of the Review

This literature review is divided into four main chapters. It starts first in Chapter 2 and 3 with a theoretical framework for the rest of this literature review. Chapter 2 gives overview on definition of the religion, discusses the sociological approach that is being used for this review and elaborate on the importance of religion in the Indonesian public sphere. After this beginning of theoretical framework, chapter on religion this review continues in Chapter 3 with a definition on ecology, describes the social capital theory that is applied within this review and addresses the importance of consensus in the ecological discourse.

In Chapter 4, this review provides overview of examples of religions in ecological discourse in Indonesia. This includes a short summary of the religious views of six religions groups recognized in Indonesia to show how these religious views interact in the interreligious dialogue on ecology. Indigenous religion due to its unique significance on the discourse on religion and nature deserve a separate work. Chapter 5, the final main chapter of this review, gives an overview of the possibilities of the interreligious dialogue

on ecology for the Indonesian public sphere. This chapter is divided into five paragraphs in which the implications for NGO's, businesses, government agencies, and faith-based organisations (FBOs) are addressed. The review ends with the conclusions and the final recommendations for scholars and practitioners alike.

02.

RELIGION IN THE INDONESIAN CONTEXT

2.1 Introduction

TO understand how religion influences the environmental discourses in Indonesia, it is first important to provide a theoretical framework on religion in Indonesia. This chapter addresses this and offers a theoretical framework on religion, by presenting a sociological theory that can be used to examine how religion influences the public discourses like the public debate on environmental issues in Indonesia. The chapter, furthermore, elaborates on the importance of religion in Indonesia by providing background information on religion in Indonesia and describes the importance of religion for the Indonesian public sphere.

This chapter starts first with a definition of religion, followed by a description of the function of religion that is implemented in this review. It will then continue with a paragraph on social capital, which is used to examine how religion impacts the environmental discourses in Indonesia. This chapter ends with a short description of the impact of religion within the Indonesian public sphere.

2.2 Definition of Religion

Religion is a contested term to define in the academic field of religious studies. There are varying perspectives in this field of study to define religion in a certain way. Although this academic field has become an interdisciplinary field with connections with psychology, anthropology, sociology, and theology, there is no universal definition of religion in this field.⁴ This is due to the different approaches and methodologies within these academic fields.⁵ This literature review does not give a clear definition of religion because of the many ways how someone can define religion. But to have a least some sort of framework of religion, this review applies the regulation structure of the Indonesian government of religion to define which religions become the focus of this review.

The Indonesian government previously only recognized six big religious groups for state services.⁶ These previously only recognized religions were Islam, Catholicism, Christianity (protestant denominations), Hinduism, Buddhism, and Confucianism. But after a Constitutional Court's decision called No. 97/PUU-XIV/2016 in 2017, the Indonesian state was encouraged to also include indigenous religions or *adat* communities within the recognized religious groups.⁷ The

4 J.B.A.M. Schilderman, "Defining Religion, a Humanities Perspective," *Journal of Empirical Theology* 27 (2014): 177.

5 Ibid.

6 Ropi, *Religion and Regulation in Indonesia*, 123.

7 Marguerite Afra Sapiie, "Constitutional Court rules indigenous faiths 'acknowledged' by state," *The Jakarta Post*. November 7, 2017. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2017/11/07/constitution->

reason why indigenous religious or *adat* communities were excluded within the regulation structure of the Indonesian government is according to the author Samsul Maarif, because of the way religion in Indonesia, *agama*, was defined by older western standards.⁸ This made the Indonesian government exclude the indigenous religion or *adat* communities within Indonesia as recognized religions, because they lacked the conceptual standards the older western religion perspective of the Indonesian government. This gives a background that show why it is difficult to define a religion within the government exclusive concept religion.

The ecological discourse in this review is based on this newer governmental structure of the previously six recognized religions and include that of the newer recognized religion of the indigenous religions in Indonesia to explore the possibilities for consensus in the interreligious dialogue on ecology. For simplification the overview of religious dialogue on ecology, Catholicism and Christianity (protestant denominations) are evaluated under the term Christianity. Both recognized religions fall under the bigger religious group Christianity and for an international audience this divide into Christianity and Catholicism could be confusing. That's why for the purpose of this review these two recognised religions are addressed in one paragraph in Chapter 4.3 and 4.4 as one religious group.

[al-court-rules-indigenous-faiths-acknowledged-by-state.html](#).

8 Samsul Maarif, "Indigenous Religion Paradigm: Re-interpreting Religious Practices of Indigenous People," *Studies in Philosophy* 44 (2019): 106.

The indigenous religions or *adat* communities are furthermore hard to define in one certain way to their enormous diversity and their close connection with other bigger religious groups like Islam and Christianity. An example of this is the indigenous community of Samin or Sedulur Sikep. This Javanese community has, for instance, a lot of Hindu and Islamic concepts in their spiritual teachings.⁹ Defining the indigenous communities in one way is thus almost impossible to do. That is why for the review purposes there this writing does not offer a clear definition on the elements or basics of the indigenous religions. But rather a description of native Indonesian indigenous communities that influence the environmental challenges discourse with some of their religious teachings.

2.3 Function of Religion

For the analytical framework, this review uses the functionalistic perspective on religion from Emile Durkheim to explore how religion can be used within the Indonesian public sphere. Durkheim's functionalistic perspective on religion is best seen within his theory on religion in *"The Elementary Forms of the Religious Life, a Study in Religious Sociology"* in which he defines religion as "a unified system of beliefs and practices relative to sacred things, that is to say, things set apart and forbidden—beliefs and practices which

9 Primi Suharmadhi Putri, "Re-Claiming Lost Possessions: A Study of the Javanese Samin (Sedulur Sikep) Movement to maintain their Peasant Identity and Access to Resources," (Master Thesis., University of Oslo, 2017), 64.

unite into one single moral community called a Church, all those who adhere to them”.¹⁰ This functionalistic perspective of Durkheim’s theory on religion can give religion many sociological functions and this is certainly handy when looking at this ecological discourse in correlation with religion and public sphere. This is because within this specific perspective field, religion can function as a legal, political, social, or psychological framework for people which can be observed within the public sphere.

This approach or perspective is often used within the sociological field on religion and can be used to describe how religion influences the ecological discourse. The social function of the interreligious dialogue on the ecological discourse is thus an important part of this review. But the legal, political, and psychological functions of religion are also addressed in this review. This is because interreligious dialogues on environmental issues are interconnected with these basic functions of religion and are, therefore, important to address in relationship with the social function of religion. The functionalistic approach can, therefore, be a useful way to explain the interreligious dialogue within the ecological discourse in Indonesia. The next paragraph on religion and social capital will further elaborate on these functions of religion with the help of the social capital theory.

2.4 Religion and Social Capital

The first sociological theory on religion that comes to mind

10 Alan Aldridge, *Religion in the Contemporary World* (Cambridge: Polity, 2007), 67.

when discussing interreligious dialogues is the theory of social capital. Especially in relationship with the public domain. This theory was first introduced by early 20th century philosophers like David Hume but was not fully worked out until Coleman and Putnam wrote about it in their works.¹¹ Although there are a lot of definitions on social capital in the academic field, the main idea of this theory is that social values and norms work the same as economic capital. This is due to its manifestation in the communication between people.

According to Fukuyama, another important author on this topic, social capital is “an instantiated informal norm that promotes co-operation between two or more individuals”.¹² It is thus a shared principle that binds two or more individuals with each other. In this definition of social capital of Fukuyama trust between individuals, civil society, and social networks are all products of social capital and not the other way around.¹³

Social capital can also be divided into three kinds of capital according to the social capital author Putnam. Putnam, for example, categorized social capital into three different kinds of capital (*bonding*, *bridging*, and *linking capital*). In his definition, *bonding* capital refers to the social

11 Steven C. Deller, Tessa Conroy, and Bjorn Markeson, “Social Capital, Religion and Small Business Activity,” *Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization* 155 (2018): 366.

12 Francis Fukuyama. “Social Capital, Civil Society and Development,” *Third World Quarterly* 22, no. 1 (2001): 7.

13 Ibid.

structure that binds people form one group with each other.¹⁴ Whilst *bridging* capital refers to the social bond between people from different groups with each other.¹⁵ *Linking capital* is, for Putnam, the relationship structure between people that undermine the status hierarchy of the groups where they belong to.¹⁶ The theory of social capital can, therefore, be used to see which principles bind, bridge, or link people together in a society.

Religion, therefore, also has an important role to play in the constructing of social capital. This is according to Fukuyama is because social capital can be a by-product of religion.¹⁷ Religion can, for example, create a common social value or norm framework for people to interact with each other which can act like a shared principle within a society or community. An Indonesian example of this can be observed in the work of the author Muhammad Iqbal Ahnaf. In his paper “*Socio-Ethical Origin of Multiculturalism in Indonesia*”, he recalled, for instance, that the Lasem community on Java fosters diversity and wasn’t much affected by the communal tension against the Chinese from 1965 till 1998.¹⁸ Ahnaf argued that this was because of how the Lasem community remembered their interethnic heritage and acknowledged

14 Nick Hopkins. “Religion and Social Capital: Identity Matters,” *Journal of Community & Applied Social Psychology* 21, no. 1 (2011): 529.

15 Ibid.

16 Ibid.

17 Fukuyama, “Social capital, civil society and development,” 17.

18 Mohamed Iqbal Afnaf, “Socio-Ethical Origin of Multiculturalism in Indonesia,” in *Multiculturalism in Asia-Peace and Harmony* (Bangkok: Konrad Adenauer Stiftung, 2018), 136.

that the earliest Muslim preachers in Indonesia had a mixed origin of Arabs, Javanese and Chinese.¹⁹ Their shared memories of interethnic heritage and mixed ethnic religious history thus acted like social capital and was important to avoid ethnic tensions in the community.

Another good example of Ahnaf of social capital in Indonesia was from Fak Fak on West Papua. According to Ahnaf, the Muslim community there actively participate in the Christian religious Easter festival and help to carry the Cross in the Easter festival in Fak Fak due to their mixed culture and families.²⁰ This helps them bond and incorporate various forms of rituals and principles as a shared foundation in order to live in a tolerant multicultural community. This is because the Easter festival there became a social event for the members of their multicultural community. This is of course a great example of how a community in Indonesia can form social capital around the same rituals and principles to promote co-operation in a religious diverse community.

Religion can, unfortunately, also play a negative role for social capital if it's based on sectarianism, according to Fukuyama.²¹ This form of religion can cause for example hatred, intolerance, and violence which undermines the processes to create social capital. An example of this can also be seen in the paper of Ahnaf. In his paper on *religious multiculturalism in Indonesia* he showed that not

19 Ibid.

20 Ahnaf, "Socio-Ethical Origin of Multiculturalism in Indonesia," in *Multiculturalism in Asia-Peace and Harmony*, 135.

21 Fukuyama, "Social Capital, civil society and development," 19.

all communities in Indonesia were as tolerant and bonded as the Lasem or Fak Fak community. An example of this was from the Sampang district on Madura (East Java). This community had a diverse community of Shiites and Sunnis that lived peacefully with each other until the turmoil in the Middle East which brought a wave of anti-Shia campaigns to Indonesia.²² This created sectarianism within this community and damaged the peacefully relationship within the Sampang community.²³ In this case, religion had a negative role for the social capital within this community because it was exploited to undermine the social relationship between the Shiites and Sunnis in Sampang. Religion can thus play a negative but also a positive role when creating social capital. The social capital theory can, therefore, be a great way to observe how religion influence the ecological debates in Indonesia, since ecological debates can also be quite heated sometimes.

2.5 Religion in the Indonesian Public Sphere

Religion has been a prominent social capital in the Indonesian public sphere. This is due to the role that religion plays in the Indonesian society. Most of the Indonesian citizens, for instance, say that they have religious affiliation with a certain religious group. According to census of the Indonesian government in 2018, almost everyone identifies his or herself as a follower of one of the six acknowledged religions in Indonesia. 99,5% of all citizens is, according to this census,

22 Ahnaf, "Socio-Ethical Origin of Multiculturalism in Indonesia," in *Multiculturalism in Asia-Peace and Harmony*, 136.

23 Ibid.

Muslim, Christian, Buddhist, Hindu, or Confucianist.²⁴ But this can also be due to the measuring method of this census and since they do not register non-affiliated citizens in their databases. It's therefore hard to say how much people are practice with religion in their daily lives.

Table 1. Religious Affiliation in Indonesia According to a Census in 2018 by the Indonesian Ministry of Religious Affairs.²⁵

Registered Religions by the Indonesian Ministry of Religious Affairs	Number of Indonesian citizens affiliated	Percentage of the Indonesian population
Islam	231.069.932	87%
Christianity	20.246.267	7,5%
Catholicism	8.325.339	3%
Hinduism	4.646.357	1,7%
Buddhism	2.062.150	0,7%
Confucianism	71.999	0,03%
Others (Including Indigenous Religions)	112.792	0,04%
Total	266.534.836	100%

But, although it's hard to say how many people are exactly observant religious obligations, religion plays a huge role within the Indonesian public sphere. The best way to observe this is by looking at how the Indonesian government

24 Berdasar Jumlah Pemeluk Agama Menurut Agama,” Kementerian Agama RI, Accessed 15 September, 2021. <https://data.kemenag.go.id/agamadashboard/statistik/umat#>.

25 Kementerian Agama RI, Berdasar Jumlah Pemeluk Agama Menurut Agama,”

uses religion in their policymaking and interacting with the Indonesian society. The Indonesian regulation is, for example, heavily based on their religious society. The Indonesian constitution is, for instance, heavily influenced by the religions within the society.

This can be seen in how the constitution emphasizes the role of religion for the Indonesian state. An illustration of this can be observed in the empathizes of a God in the Indonesian constitution. According to Ismatu Ropi, who was mentioned earlier, the Indonesian constitution demands the acknowledgement of God in each of the constitution versions that were written.²⁶ So, the belief in a God is according to its constitution an important part of the state forming. This has, of course, a lot of influence on the citizens that don't believe in a God or people that have a religion like, for example, Buddhism that is not focussed on a God. Besides this empathize of a God in the constitution, the importance of religion can also be observed by how the law in Indonesia is based on religious values and norms.²⁷ There is, for instance, a lot of religious symbolism in the Indonesia laws according to Ismatu Ropi.²⁸ Religion is, therefore, important within the legal framework of Indonesia.

Aside from this role that religion has within the governmental system of Indonesia, the importance of religion for the public sphere in Indonesia can also be seen in how the government govern the religious diversity

26 Ropi, *Religion and Regulation in Indonesia*, 19.

27 Ibid.

28 Ibid.

within Indonesia. Indonesia has, for example, a Ministry of Religious Affairs. This ministry was formed soon after the independence of Indonesia in 1946 to regulate the religion-related affairs in the country.²⁹ By regulating the religious affairs like religious-education and religious celebrations in Indonesia. The Indonesian government is thus involved with governing the religious practices of their citizens.

Other than this ministry, the significance of religion for the public sphere is also apparent in how the government registers the religion of their citizens in their databases. Every citizen, also including immigrant in Indonesia, is, for instance, obligated to register their religion for their passport or identification papers. The Indonesian state thus puts a lot of attention on the religious background of their citizens to manage the religious diversity within their society.

Another example of the importance of religion for the public sphere in Indonesia is discussed the paper of Zainal Abidin Bagir titled “*The Importance of Religion and Ecology in Indonesia*”. Bagir showed in his article that religion occupies a central topic within the public debates in Indonesia, such as the public debate on the environmental challenges in Indonesia.³⁰ Many religious leaders are for instance involved with protecting their environment.³¹ This makes religion an important part of the public sphere in Indonesia, because it contributes to shape the public debates.

29 Julia Suryakusuma, “Religious Affairs Ministry: White elephant or political necessity?”, *The Jakarta Post*, June 23, 2017, <https://www.thejakartapost.com/academia/2016/06/23/religious-affairs-ministry-white-elephant-or-political-necessity.html>.

30 Bagir, “The Importance of Religion and Ecology in Indonesia”, 99.

31 Bagir, “The Importance of Religion and Ecology in Indonesia”, 100.

03.

INTERRELIGIOUS DIALOGUE WITHIN THE ECOLOGICAL DISCOURSE

3.1 Introduction

As seen in the previous chapter, religion has an important role within the public sphere in Indonesia and it could, therefore, be an important factor to address the environmental challenges in Indonesia. This chapter discusses these implications, by outlining how religion is involved within the ecological discourse in Indonesia and include this in interreligious dialogue program. To understand how interreligious dialogue can address the ecological discourse in Indonesia, it is first important to recognize what interreligious dialogue is exactly and how it is involved in the ecological discourse in Indonesia.

This chapter addresses this and gives a definition on interreligious dialogue and describes how the theory of social capital is intertwined with a term like interreligious dialogue. A key in this purpose is forming consensus and cooperation within an interreligious dialogue on the ecological worldviews and its relevance to the environmental challenges in Indonesia. Before this review continues to explain how interreligious dialogues are tangled within

the current environmental issues in Indonesia, it is first important to address the definition of ecology that is used in this review.

3.2 Ecology

Ecology is an ambiguous term that produce different interpretations. Literally, it can mean actual literal meaning of the word ecology, it means house, place to live or home in the old Greek word of *oikos* and this old Greek word was used by Ernst Haeckel to derive his term for *oekologie* on.³² Conceptually, the *Collins Dictionary* define ecology as “the study of the relationships between plants, animals, people, and their environment, and the balances between these relationships”.³³

This Ernst Haeckel was the first to introduce the term *ecologie/oekologie* to define “a relation of the animal both to its organic as well as its inorganic environment.”³⁴ This shows that the definition of ecology has changed through the years and can be very ambiguous in its definition. In this literature review the term ecology is based around the ideas and views that people have on their environment (other organisms and their physical surroundings). Especially about environmental challenges, like water pollution, air pollution and deforestation.

32 Stuart L. Pimm, Robert Leo Smith, “Ecology,” Accessed April 18, 2019, <https://www.britannica.com/science/ecology>.

33 “Definition of ‘ecology,’” *Collins Dictionary*, Accessed April 18, 2019, <https://www.collinsdictionary.com/dictionary/english/ecology>.

34 Ibid.

This idea is often referred as deep ecology in the field of religion and ecology. Deep ecology refers to people's deeper inner values on nature that influence their standing on environmental issues. This review explores these deeper inner values on nature by looking at religious values or views from the major religions in Indonesia towards nature to explain the way how these views interact with the current debate on environmental challenges. This can be very important to fully understand the environmental discourses because some authors in the ecology field suggest that we now live in the *Anthropocene* era, in which we as humans have a full control on the worldwide nature. Deeper inner values or deep ecology can therefore be possibly very influential in tackling the current issues relating the *Anthropocene*.

3.3 Interreligious Dialogue

How can religion influence the environmental challenges in Indonesia? To answer this question, the first thing that needs to be defined is the interreligious dialogue in Indonesia. As mentioned earlier, religion plays a huge role in the Indonesian public sphere. The religious advocacy can thus play a big role in changings or tackling the environmental challenges.

One religious group alone cannot tackle it on its own and, therefore, the cooperation between different religions must be an important aspect of their advocacy to avoid conflicts within their society. Interreligious dialogues could be useful to raise awareness about the environmental challenges, but one should also be concerned with using religion, because it also can lead to conflict when people can't tolerate other

views. But what is interreligious dialogue and how can it help to avoid conflicts?

According to Mahmood Vaezi, the meaning of *interreligious dialogue* can be explained by the two words *interreligious* and *dialogue*.³⁵ *Interreligious* means between religions and *dialogue* means something like a “chat” and reverse to a form of communication between people.³⁶ In his article, “*The role of interreligious dialogue on religious tolerance*”, he explained that it is a form of communication between followers of different religions in which they use their own religious values.³⁷ Interreligious dialogues can be conducted in many ways, like workshops between religious leaders, forums between religious followers, or public lectures with participants from different religious backgrounds. The only thing that is important for these dialogues, is a form of communication between people with different religious backgrounds in it. Interreligious dialogue, according to Vaezi, has an important element in reducing conflicts between religious followers. This is because interreligious dialogues, when they are followed by a set of rules, can lead to more affection and tolerance of other religious views within people.³⁸ Which in turn can reduce conflicts between people.

35 Mahmood Vaezi, “The Role of Interreligious Dialogues on Religious Tolerance,” *HTS Teologiese Studies/ Theological Studies* 74, no. 3 (2018): 2.

36 Ibid.

37 Ibid.

38 Vaezi, “The Role of Interreligious Dialogues on Religious Tolerance,” 8.

This is also an important thing to hold in mind because public discourses on environmental challenges can, sometimes, also be very intolerant and sometimes even lead to conflicts. An example of this can be given of the Paris riots in 2019, in which people protested the plan of the French government to raise the carbon tax on fuel to reduce CO2 emissions.³⁹ Interreligious dialogues could, therefore, be useful to reduce future conflicts. But only if these dialogues are being met by people that cannot only talk about their own views but also listen and respect the views of the other.⁴⁰ Otherwise, this will lead to sectarianism, according to the social capital theory of Fukuyama.⁴¹

Although the idea of interreligious dialogues is not new, it is still being met with a many scepticism. In Malaysia, for example, there are already interreligious dialogues since the 1950's but a lot of people within their society mistrust those initiatives.⁴² This is due to misguided information about these initiatives that are often workshops between religious leaders.⁴³ Which often have a lot of jargon and are being seen as intellectual discourses, even though they are mend to

39 Reem Khamis, "Repercussions of French rioting on climate change," *An-Nahar*, December 6, 2018, <https://en.annahar.com/article/911080-the-repercussions-of-french-rioting-on-the-rapid-increase-of-climate-change>.

40 Vaezi, "The Role of Interreligious Dialogues on Religious Tolerance," 2.

41 Fukuyama, "Social capital, civil society and development," 19.

42 Wan Sabri Wan Yusof, and Arfah Ab Majid, "Inter-Religious Dialogue Models in Malaysia," *Global Journal Al-Thaqafah* 2, no. 1 (2012): 7.

43 Ibid.

help the public discourses.⁴⁴ So a well working interreligious dialogue on environmental challenges that wants to help to improve the public discourse should be very careful how they present themselves to the public.

But interreligious dialogues could still play important role in Indonesia as seen in the works of Fatimah Hussein. In her paper called “*Youth Expressions of Religiosity through Dialogue in Indonesia*”, she described how Indonesian youth participated in multiple programmes and initiatives on multiple topics.⁴⁵ She described five interreligious youth programmes and initiatives on different topics and saw that the youth that participated in these interreligious dialogue programmes were influenced through it.⁴⁶

Interreligious dialogues could, therefore, take place, for example, combining the Indonesian youth expressions of religiosity, especially with topics that concern the Indonesian youth like the environmental issues.⁴⁷

44 Wan Sabri Wan Yusof, and Arfah Ab Majid, “Inter-Religious Dialogue Models in Malaysia,” 8.

45 Fatimah Husein, “Youth Expressions of Religiosity through Dialogue in Indonesia,” *International Journal of Interreligious and Intercultural Studies* 2, no. 2 (2019): 1.

46 Husein, “Youth Expressions of Religiosity through Dialogue in Indonesia,” 16.

47 Pam Nilan, “Indonesian Youth, Global Environmentalism and Transnational Mining,” *Youth and Globalization* 1, No. 1 (2019): 166-167.

3.4 Social Capital and Interreligious Dialogue

Interreligious dialogue is a key arena where religion as social capital comes into play. This theory can be a very good base to explore how interreligious dialogues can improve public discourses. Social capital is a way to analytically describe the way values and morals bind people together by giving them a common base to form their relationship on. This is parallel with how interreligious dialogues function if they are properly setup. According to Paul Weller, interreligious initiatives, like interreligious dialogues, can have the potential to provide bridging social capital between people.⁴⁸ This pertains to the way these types of initiatives facilitate a sense of common concern about a specific topic.⁴⁹ But it can also have an opposite reaction of bridging social capital, since mismatched communication of religious values and morals between people can also lead to conflicts.⁵⁰ This, according to Weller, can even destroy the fabric of societies when not addressed properly.⁵¹

But the benefits of good working interreligious dialogues could also be very great as suggested by Dieter Gerten and Sigurd Bergmann. These two authors wrote a book on the way interreligious dialogues influence the social capital in a society on environmental and global warming issues and they stated that interreligious dialogues can strengthen

48 Paul Weller, "State(s), and Society(ies): with Particular Reference to the United Kingdom and the European Union," *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 6, no. 2 (2005): 285.

49 Ibid.

50 Ibid.

51 Ibid.

the advocacy on these issues.⁵² This is due to the fact that interreligious dialogue can strengthen the social ties in an environmental advocacy group by exchanging different ecological worldviews that have a common basis.⁵³ Which in turn creates a process for bridging social capital within a group of environmental advocacy groups.

But this form of dialogue is most often only successful if the people who participate in these dialogues or initiatives have shared culture or live in the same area.⁵⁴ This is because people with a common culture or shared life within a local area have a common bond outside their religious backgrounds. Which can in turn strengthen their ties with people with different religious backgrounds within their communities. An example of this was an interreligious initiative in Yogyakarta in 2009 on climate changes in Indonesia. This meeting that was called “*Climate Change and the Religions in Indonesia*” was attended by Muslims and Christians alike to addresses the current environmental issues in Indonesia.⁵⁵ Due to the interreligious initiative on this topic most participants of the local universities in Yogyakarta began to form interreligious alliances to advocate against the environmental issues.⁵⁶ It was expected that their shared way of living in this city would create a way to bond with each other and form alliances to

52 Dieter Gerten, and Sigurd Bergmann, eds. *Religion in Environmental and Climate Change: Suffering, Values, Lifestyles*, (London: Bloomsbury, 2013), 39.

53 Ibid.

54 Ibid.

55 Dieter Gerten, and Sigurd Bergmann, eds. *Religion in Environmental and Climate Change: Suffering, Values, Lifestyles*, 40.

56 Ibid.

further advocate against environmental issues. Interreligious initiatives can, therefore, create a common base to form alliances to advocate against environmental issues.

This, according to Gerten and Bergmann, is due to the way religion function as a social actor in the public sphere⁵⁷ and create a common sense of morals or views that strengthen bonds between people who share perspectives.⁵⁸ That is also why Gerten and Bergmann stated that religion should be integrated into the public debate on environmental issues because of its influence on the discourse.⁵⁹

Interreligious dialogues could, therefore, be an excellent way to integrate religion on the public debate on environmental issues, on account of the way in which it can create bridging social capital. As Gerten and Bergmann suggest, this is also because religion can create awareness among their own religious community on the environmental challenges according to.⁶⁰

3.5 Consensus and Interreligious Dialogue

This brings us to the importance of consensus, cooperation, and its relationship with the interreligious dialogue. Particularly, the case of the current ecological discourse on the environmental challenges, consensus, and cooperation are very important in the advocacy against like, for example, water pollution. Someone can, for example, want to reduce

57 Dieter Gerten, and Sigurd Bergmann, eds. *Religion in Environmental and Climate Change: Suffering, Values, Lifestyles*, 42.

58 Ibid.

59 Ibid.

60 Ibid.

water pollution in a local river, but if people upstream keep polluting it, there won't be a reduction of the water pollution in the river. Cooperation is, therefore, key in certain environmental challenges. But to reach a working level of cooperation between people in an interreligious dialogue, it is also important to reach a consensus in the dialogue on the environmental challenges.

Consensus building could therefore also be very important in the interreligious dialogue. Consensus building requires bargaining and dispute resolution.⁶¹ Both are really important to reach a certain level of cooperation on the environmental issues because these discourses on the environment can be very heated. Bargaining and meditation between groups are, thus, very important in interreligious dialogues on this public discourse.

According to Judith Innes, a well-known author on consensus building, consensus building is widely used in fisheries management and water resources management.⁶² A mismanagement of water resources or fishery management can, for instance, cause a lot of problems for the environment. It is, thus, already been used within the policymaking aspects that influence this ecological discourse. Furthermore, according to Innes, consensus building can produce social capital between people if the dialogues are setup properly.⁶³ This is due to the way it can further strengthen the support

61 Judith E. Innes, "Consensus Building: Clarifications for the Critics," *Planning Theory* 3, no. 1 (2004): 6.

62 Judith E. Innes, "Consensus Building: Clarifications for the Critics," 7.

63 Judith E. Innes, "Consensus Building: Clarifications for the Critics," 8.

on a certain issue, by making sure that everyone in the dialogue can support the outcome. But, in order to reach this level of consensus in a dialogue, it is very important to have key stakeholders that can facilitate such dialogues.⁶⁴ Which, in turn, needs to be neutral in the dialogue so that every participant in the dialogue can feel comfortable enough to reach a consensus in the dialogue.⁶⁵

An orderly dialogue is thus needed to create a good working interreligious dialogue on ecology, in which people can come to a consensus with each other. Until now, most of these dialogues are being setup by non-government organizations (NGO's) and other non-profit organizations to further advocate against environmental challenges.⁶⁶ But there are also cases in, for example, the USA where businesses and NGO's had dialogues about environmental issues in order to get more support for developing rural and poorer cities.⁶⁷ This shows that businesses can also adopt a consensus building strategy to strengthen their economic position by making agreements with environmental advocacy groups. But that being said, there is also a lot of criticism this strategy. This is because in certain cases it cannot workout in the way that was first intended. An effective consensus building is, for example, only possible if there is an open discourse in which people with different views or positions can interact with each other.⁶⁸

64 Judith E. Innes, "Consensus Building: Clarifications for the Critics," 10.

65 Judith E. Innes, "Consensus Building: Clarifications for the Critics," 8.

66 Judith E. Innes, "Consensus Building: Clarifications for the Critics," 10.

67 Judith E. Innes, "Consensus Building: Clarifications for the Critics," 11.

68 Andrew Gouldson and Peter W Roberts, *Integrating Environment and Economy: Strategies for Local and Regional Government* (London:

This is, unfortunately, not always the case, due to conflicting interests and policy making strategies that undermine the involvement of the public in certain issues.⁶⁹ In order to have a working interreligious dialogue on environmental challenges that can actually change something their firsts needs to be a bases of involvement of businesses and governments to create a working consensus. This is, in certain cases, even the only way to reduce environmental problems, like, for instance, water planning challenges.

An example of this is given by a research conducted by Claudia Baldwin and Helen Ross. In their case study of an Australian water planning initiative, they came to the conclusion that consensus building in this initiative was very important to achieve a better water planning management style.⁷⁰ This was due to the fact that it didn't undermine the interests and values of all the participants and stakeholders in their meeting, which, in turn, reduced conflicts in the dialogues, so that people could work together on the same issue that influenced them all.⁷¹

Consensus, cooperation, and interreligious dialogues are, therefore, closely connected with each other. But, to fully understand each other's standpoints, it is also important to know a bit about the ecological views of the religious groups

Routledge, 2002), 240.

69 Ibid.

70 Claudia Baldwin and Helen Ross, "Bridging Troubled Waters: Applying Consensus-Building Techniques to Water Planning," *Society and Natural Resources* 25, no. 3 (2012): 230.

71 Ibid.

that could participate in it. In the next chapter this will be given with the help of examples of views and interreligious practices in Indonesia of the six major religions that influence the environmental challenges.

04.

EXAMPLES OF RELIGION IN THE ECOLOGICAL DISCOURSE IN INDONESIA

4.1 Introduction

AS previously mentioned in the last paragraph, consensus, cooperation, and interreligious dialogues are closely connected with each other and can be used within the ecological discourse in Indonesia. But to grasp how this can be done, it is first important to address each other's religious views and practices.

This chapter provides this with the help of examples of religious initiatives and religious doctrines in the ecological discourse in Indonesia by offering an overview of examples of views and practices within the Indonesian religions. This includes a short summary of religious views and practices of the religious groups in Indonesia that are being discussed within this literature review. It also offers some key concepts within the discussed religions in order to highlight which religious views are important within the ecological discourses.

4.2 Islam and Ecology

The first religion that will be discussed is Islam, the large majority religion in Indonesia. According to the census of the Ministry of Religious Affairs in 2010, 87% of Indonesia identified him or herself as Muslim.⁷² Indonesia is also by number of people the biggest Muslim country in the world.⁷³ So, by number of people, they can have a lot of influence on the public discourse in Indonesia, but also within the worldwide Muslim community.

There is already a lot written about the ecological views within Islam and some have called this form Eco-Islam. The past decades there has been a big emphasis on ecology within the Islamic world. According to authors, like Schwecke and Zbidi, this Islam movement started around the 1960's as a countermovement against environmental issues, according to the authors, by addressing the monotheistic beliefs that were the cause of the environmental challenges.⁷⁴ This religious movement, therefore, started to use religious concepts within Islam to advocate against the environmental issues.

The main concepts that they use in their reasoning and why they should care about their environment can be

72 Kementerian Agama RI, "Berdasar Jumlah Pemeluk Agama Menurut Agama,"

73 Remy Madinier, *Islam and Politics in Indonesia: The Masyumi Party between Democracy and Integralism*, Translated by Jeremy Desmond (Singapore: NUS Press, 2015), 16.

74 Dina Abdelzaher, Amr Kotb and Akrum Helfaya, "Eco-Islam: Beyond the Principles of why and What, and into the Principles of how," *Journal of Business Ethics* 155, no. 3 (2019): 627.

found in how they explain the Quran. A key concept of this is the *khalifa*, a belief that people should be the guardians of the environment.⁷⁵ Due to special relationship that God has granted them as vice-regents or stewards on the earth.⁷⁶ Another key concept within this movement is the *tawheed*, or belief in oneness of God. This principle is often used within this movement to explain why Muslims should care about their environmental.⁷⁷ This is because of their spiritual believe that the environment is united with mankind due to this key concept in Islam.⁷⁸

Besides these two concepts within this religious movements, *maslahah* is also an important principle in Islam that they use in their reasonings to advocate against the environmental challenges.⁷⁹ This key concept means to come up for the public good and its aimed to achieve a sustainable world.⁸⁰ This main concept is also explained by the way they observe the Quran. The qur'anic teachings are, therefore, an important part within this religious environmental groups. This is due to the way they put emphasizes on qur'anic verses to explain why they should advocate against environmental challenges.

Beside these concepts that are being used within the ecological discourses another major development that came

75 Ibid.

76 Ibid.

77 Dina Abdelzaher, Amr Kotb and Akrum Helfaya, "Eco-Islam: Beyond the Principles of why and What, and into the Principles of how," 625.

78 Ibid.

79 Dina Abdelzaher, Amr Kotb and Akrum Helfaya, "Eco-Islam: Beyond the Principles of why and What, and into the Principles of how," 628.

80 Ibid.

forward within the Indonesian Muslim population, is the use of *fiqh* (Islamic jurisprudence) within this discourse. This development occurred around the beginning of the 2000's and was made mainstream by the economist Emil Salim.⁸¹ Emil Salim brought this topic under discussion during a meeting supported by the World Bank in 2001 and it was later picked up by other initiatives.⁸²

But this is not the only way *fiqh* and the ecological discourse relate to each other in Indonesia. A great example of this was a fatwa declared in January 2014 against the trafficking of wildlife within Indonesia.⁸³ The council that produced this fatwa stated that their religious companions should protect the wildlife, even though government regulation wasn't as forward as their fatwa.⁸⁴ This was a direct result of the way Islamic scholars within the *fiqh* started to write non-legal binding fatwa's in the beginning of the 2000's against environmental issues.⁸⁵

Another example of a fatwa against an environmental issue in Indonesia was issued by Islamic scholars from Kalimantan which stated that destroying the jungle for industrial benefits was *haram* or forbidden in Islam.⁸⁶ This

81 Anna M. Gade, "Islamic Law and the Environment in Indonesia," *Worldviews: Global Religions, Culture, and Ecology* 19, no. 2 (2015): 165.

82 Ibid.

83 Kathryn M. Werntz, "Indonesia's fatwa shows religious duty can be a route to sustainable behaviour," *The Guardian*, March 24, 2014, <https://www.theguardian.com/sustainable-business/religion-environment-wildlife-trafficking-indonesia-fatwa-sustainable>.

84 Ibid.

85 Anna M. Gade, "Islamic Law and the Environment in Indonesia," 165.

86 Thomas A. Reuter, "The Green Revolution in the World's Religions:

gives to show that fatwas are being used within Indonesia to trigger the Indonesian Muslim community to act against environmental issues.

In this way, by declaring fatwas, these scholars wanted to bring these issues, according to Anna Gade, to the public by making it a *dakwah*, or ‘call’, in which they wanted to make this teaching a practice in the daily lives of most followers of Islam.⁸⁷ The environmental issues in Indonesia are, thus, sometimes a topic that are addressed by Islamic scholars in certain fatwa’s to create more support under the Muslim community against environmental problems.

Another example that one could give about the way Islam and ecological advocacy are interconnected with each other are the Islamic environmental campaigns. There are, for instance, a lot of Islamic environmental campaigns in Indonesia that use their religion to further address ecological issues. An example of this was a *plastic waste campaign* in 2018 during the Ramadan to reduce the plastic waste in the environment.⁸⁸ This campaign was promoted by the Indonesian government, Greenpeace and two of the largest Muslim organisations in the country, Muhammadiyah and Nadhlatul Ulama (NU). During the campaign in the Ramadan, they encouraged clerics within Islam to advocate against the

Indonesian Examples in International Comparison,” *Religions* 6, no. 4 (2015): 1223.

87 Anna M. Gade, “Islamic Law and the Environment in Indonesia,” 162.

88 “Appealing to Indonesia’s Muslims”, Qantara, Accessed April 23, 2019, <https://en.qantara.de/content/islam-and-single-use-plastics-appealing-to-indonesias-muslims>.

use of disposable plastics to raise awareness of this issue in Indonesia.⁸⁹

The *pesantren* (Islamic boarding schools) system in Indonesia are another good example of the interconnectedness between Islam and ecology in Indonesia. These *pesantren* are traditional educational institution where mainly young Muslims from areas learn about their religion and morals from local religious leaders.⁹⁰ Some of these *pesantren* raise awareness on the current environmental issues that the Indonesian society faces on this very moment.⁹¹ These kind of *pesantrens*, sometimes referred as Green *Pesantrens*, incorporate religious views on the environment in the educational curriculum.⁹² The religious education within the Muslim community in Indonesia is, thus, used a manner to spread awareness on environmental issues.

These examples show that there is an ecological discourse within the Muslim community in Indonesia that uses the religious background of the citizens to further advocate for better environmental behaviour by addressing the topic in the mosques. Most Indonesian Muslims also

89 Ibid.

90 Herdis Herdiansyah, Trisasono Jokopitoyo, and Ahmad Munir, "Environmental Awareness to Realizing Green Islamic Boarding School (eco-Pesantren) in Indonesia," *Top Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science* 30 (2016): 2.

91 Herdis Herdiansyah, Trisasono Jokopitoyo, and Ahmad Munir, "Environmental Awareness to Realizing Green Islamic Boarding School (eco-Pesantren) in Indonesia," 2.

92 Herdis Herdiansyah, Trisasono Jokopitoyo, and Ahmad Munir, "Environmental Awareness to Realizing Green Islamic Boarding School (eco-Pesantren) in Indonesia," 5.

tend to see ecology as an empirical fact, due to their view on the interconnectedness with nature.⁹³ Islam is, thus, closely connected within the environmental discourse in Indonesia and especially in the advocacy against environmental challenges. Some authors, like Mangunjaya and McKay, even stated that the Indonesian case can be a model for the rest of the Muslim world.⁹⁴ This is due to its mixture of Islamic teachings and environmental project setup by the government and non-governmental organizations.

4.3 Eco-Islam and Interreligious Dialogue

Intrareligious initiatives, within their own community, are not the only examples of Eco-Islam within the environmental challenges discourse in Indonesia. There are, for instance, also a couple of interreligious initiatives in Indonesia that focus on ecological discourse. An example of this was an interreligious dialogue initiative in 2009 in Yogyakarta that was called “*Climate Change and the Religions in Indonesia*”.⁹⁵ During these meeting Muslims and Christian talked about the current climate change issues that Indonesia has to face in the future and how their religious communities could hold to reduce these issues.⁹⁶

93 Thomas A. Reuter, “The Green Revolution in the World’s Religions: Indonesian Examples in International Comparison,” 1222.

94 Mangunjaya, Fachruddin Majeri, and Jeanne Elizabeth McKay. “Reviving an Islamic Approach for Environmental Conservation in Indonesia,” *Worldviews* 16, no. 3 (2012): 303.

95 Dieter Gerten and Sigurd Bergmann, eds. *Religion in Environmental and Climate Change: Suffering, Values, Lifestyles*, (London: Bloomsbury, 2013), 40.

96 Ibid.

Another example of this was the *Interfaith Rainforest Initiative*, an interreligious alliance formed by multiple NGO's and faith bases organization throughout the world.⁹⁷ This initiative was set up to make sure leaders within Islam, Christianity, Judaism, Hinduism, Buddhism, and Daoism would discuss the topic of deforestation among each other.⁹⁸ These initiatives, however, are often initiated by international organizations. As seen in the article of Thomas Reuter, who wrote on Eco-Islam within Indonesia, and said that a big missing component in Indonesia is a lack of a national interfaith alliance on ecology.⁹⁹ There are already some initiatives to arrange such a national alliance, but most of them are very local and don't focus on Islamic organizations or communities.¹⁰⁰ This, according to Thomas Reuter, is mainly due to a lack of support of the Indonesian government and other public support to interfaith initiatives on ecology.¹⁰¹ There could, thus, potentially be a lot more interreligious dialogue enterprises on ecology, if there was more support from the public for the faith-based organizations and NGO's that setup these type of events.

97 "Religious leaders join interfaith rainforest initiative in Oslo today," The Forum on Religion and Ecology at Yale, Accessed April 23, 2019, <http://fore.yale.edu/news/item/religious-leaders-join-inter-faith-rainforest-initiative-in-oslo-today/>.

98 Ibid.

99 Thomas A. Reuter, "The Green Revolution in the World's Religions: Indonesian Examples in International Comparison," 1227.

100 Ibid.

101 Thomas A. Reuter, "The Green Revolution in the World's Religions: Indonesian Examples in International Comparison," 1225.

4.4 Christianity and Ecology

Christianity is the second largest religious group in Indonesia, when you combine the Catholic and other Christian groups. They form around 7,5% of the religious population in Indonesia, so they are right after Islam the second biggest influential group in Indonesia.¹⁰² This religious group is also one of the most studied groups in relation to ecology. There are lot of articles written on the relationship between Christianity and ecology, especially in relationship with the theological teachings within this religion on nature and environmental issues. A big example of a Christian initiative on ecology was for instance *Laudato Si*, a papal encyclical issued by Pope Francis in 2015.¹⁰³ This encyclical was very influential within the worldwide catholic community and was mainly issued to pressure local catholic churches to locally address environmental issues that affect their community.¹⁰⁴

But there are also a lot of faith-based organizations, like, for instance, the *Green Christian*, a FBO based in the United Kingdom, that partakes in all kind of environmental issue advocacy events throughout the world, including Indonesia.¹⁰⁵ These FBO's are often based around theological

102 Kementerian Agama RI, "Berdasar Jumlah Pemeluk Agama Menurut Agama,"

103 W.N Holden and W.O Mansfield, "Laudato Si: A Scientifically Informed Church of the Poor Confronts Climate Change," *Worldviews: Environment, Culture, Religion* 22, no. 1 (2018): 29.

104 W.N Holden and W.O Mansfield, "Laudato Si: A Scientifically Informed Church of the Poor Confronts Climate Change," 49.

105 "About: Ordinary Christians, Extraordinary Times," *GreenChristian*, Accessed April 23, 2019, <https://greenchristian.org.uk/connect/about/>.

frameworks within their religion that show the importance of nature according to their beliefs. This theological field is often called Eco-Theology and it became a new movement in the 60's and 70's of the previous century when the whole environmental concern topics was introduced to the mainstream.¹⁰⁶ This theological field was predominant formed around an agrarian movement in the 1930's in the West, that became aware of the environmental problems that influenced their communities, so it already exists for a couple of decennia.¹⁰⁷

Eco-Theology was also very important in the introduction of major concepts within the Christian theology that are still being using in the present environmental discourses around the world. A key concept, for instance, within this theology is the idea that people should be the guardians of creation.¹⁰⁸ This view looks of course a lot like the Eco-Islam concept of *khalifa* and is often used by Christian leaders on their rhetoric's against environmental challenges. A clear example of this can be found within the papal encyclical "Laudato Si" by Pope Francis. In *Laudato Si*, he expressed his view that people should take more responsibility about their environment due to the Christian view that people are the guardians of the creation.¹⁰⁹ This concept is, sometimes,

106 Panu Pihkala, "Rediscovery of Early Twentieth-Century Ecotheology," *Open Theology* 2, no. 1 (2016): 269.

107 Panu Pihkala, "Rediscovery of Early Twentieth-Century Ecotheology," 270.

108 Celia Deane-Drummond, *Eco-Theology*, (London: Darton, Longman Todd, 2008), 53.

109 "Encyclical Letter 'Laudato Si' of the Holy Father Francis on Care for

also called *Christian stewardship* and is, according to Gareth Jones, most often used by “evangelical and bible-centered Christians” or protestant denominations.¹¹⁰ This idea comes according to Gareth Jones from a verse in chapter 2 of Genesis in which God makes Adam the leader of the animals.¹¹¹ So, this concept is heavily drawn around biblical explanations in the book of Genesis.

But there is also a lot of criticism against this major concept from Eco-Christianity. According to some authors, ecology is the cause of an *Anthropocene* era which caused the current environmental challenges. A clear example of this can be given in the article “*Ecology and Contemporary Christian Theology*” from Whitney Bauman, a highly influential writer within the Eco-Theological world. In this article, he wrote that this concept in itself can actually also cause for more environmental problems according to theologians, like Peter Scott.¹¹² Peter Scott, for instance, sees that this concept of *stewardship* over the creation can isolated mankind from the rest of the environment which creates a worldview in which environmental problems don’t matter at all.¹¹³ This is due to

our Common Home,” Vatican, Accessed April 23, 2019. http://w2.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/encyclicals/documents/papa-francesco_20150524_enciclica-laudato-si.html.

110 J. B. Stump and Alan G. Padgett, *The Blackwell Companion to Science and Christianity*, (Chichester, West Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell, 2012), 477.

111 J. B. Stump and Alan G. Padgett, *The Blackwell Companion to Science and Christianity*, 467.

112 Bauman, Whitney. “Ecology and Contemporary Christian Theology,” *Religion Compass* 5, no. 8 (2011): 386.

113 Ibid.

the way in which it can put mankind outside the creation/nature by putting it on the head of the hierarchical ladder. The concept of *Christian stewardship* is, therefore, a highly controversial Eco-Theological topic, but, nonetheless, an important concept that is being used within ecological discourses around the world.

Another major concept within the Eco-Theology revolves around the Christian idea of *salvation*. According to Roger Meinert and Bruce Yandle, many Christian environmental advocacy writers use this concept to address the environmental problems.¹¹⁴ Most often these writers use this concept of *salvation* to provide comments on the industrialized societies and state that they want to go back to a time in which these societies didn't corrupt the environment.¹¹⁵

The third concept that is a big part of Eco-Christianity revolves around the spiritual view within Eco-Theology. This concept that revolves around the harmony of people and nature is used by many Eco-Christian groups that aim to bring back a kind of "*Heaven on Earth*".¹¹⁶ These concepts are used in several ecological discourses throughout Indonesia and they can be very successful in certain areas. An example of this was an initiative in North-Sulawesi which collaborated with local churches to advocate for a better use of their

114 Roger E. Meinert and Bruce Yandle, *Taking the Environment Seriously. The Political Economy Forum*, (Lanham, Md.: Rowman & Littlefield, 1993), 240.

115 Ibid.

116 Roger E. Meinert and Bruce Yandle, *Taking the Environment Seriously. The Political Economy Forum*, 243.

environment by the local people.¹¹⁷ During church meetings and Sunday school meetings the people there, were learned not to eat *bushmeat* anymore and to better use the natural resources in their community to protect their environment. According to the study that examined this case, this kind of cooperation between the church and conservation organizations was highly successful due to the way it could connect the local people with this topic.¹¹⁸

This kind of initiative could, for instance, also learn the elderly people in the North-Sulawesi community on the importance of sustainable practices with their environment through the church meetings. This practice is also apparent in the younger generation through the Sunday school meetings in which they taught the children on the importance of the environment. This case in Sulawesi is certainly not the only Christian initiative against environmental issues in Indonesia. There were in the past years, for example, also campaigns launched by local churches in Toraja (Central Sulawesi) and the Batak Church in North-Sumatra.¹¹⁹ There are thus many examples of this in Indonesia and some of the Christian communities in Indonesia play, thus, an active part in the advocacy against environmental challenges in Indonesia.

117 Sheherazade and Susan M Tsang, "Quantifying the Bat Bushmeat Trade in North Sulawesi, Indonesia, with Suggestions for Conservation Action," *Global Ecology and Conservation* 3 (2015): 329.

118 Ibid.

119 Author unknown, *Faiths and the Environment: World Bank Support 2000–05*, (Washington: The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/ The World Bank, 2006), 19.

Collaborations between Christian communities and other organisations could, therefore, be very effective in reducing environmental problems when using eco-theological frameworks in the advocacy. Since Christian communities and Christian FBO's are involved with the ecological discourse in Indonesia.

4.5 Eco-Christianity and Interreligious Dialogue

Eco-Christianity is also closely connected with interreligious initiatives in Indonesia. There are a couple of examples of these types of interreligious cooperation. A clear example of this was of course the interreligious dialogue initiative from 2009 “*Climate Change and Religions in Indonesia*”, in which Christians and Muslims discussed about climate change.¹²⁰

This is not the only example of an interreligious dialogue in which Eco-Christianity took part in. Another clear example of an interreligious initiative with Eco-Christianity is a blog site called *Balebengong* in which followers of different faiths, including Christianity, discuss environmental challenges in Indonesia.¹²¹ Eco-Christianity is, therefore, also already participating on social media platforms to promote interreligious dialogue against environmental issues.

Another example of interreligious dialogues, that includes Eco-Christianity, was the *Jakarta Statement*

120 Dieter Gerten, and Sigurd Bergmann, eds. *Religion in Environmental and Climate Change: Suffering, Values, Lifestyles*, 40.

121 Thomas A. Reuter, “The Green Revolution in the World's Religions: Indonesian Examples in International Comparison,” 1227.

Initiative from the Asia & Pacific Interfaith Youth Network in 2017. This statement occurred after a meeting in 2017 between religious youth leaders across Indonesia on climate change and in that statement, they called for a mutual action of religious followers in Indonesia against environmental issues.¹²² In this statement they committed to raise awareness on social media on climate change and to advocate for the recycling of plastics.¹²³

There are, thus, a couple interreligious initiatives in Indonesia which include Eco-Christian groups in Indonesia. But one major point of criticism that can be given to this initiative is that most of them are mainly intellectual discourses arranged by NGO's and FBO's among university students. These types of interreligious dialogues are, therefore, handy to create a new generation of religious leaders that want to address the environmental challenges in Indonesia. But they don't immediately change the public discourse in Indonesia on the environmental issues, due to the small scale in which these dialogues are setup, which doesn't make it a broader movement.

122 Author unknown, "Religions for Peace Asia Interfaith Youth Peace Camp 2017: Jakarta Statement," Jakarta: Religions for Peace Asia & the Pacific Interfaith Youth Network, 2017, 1.

123 Author unknown, "Religions for Peace Asia Interfaith Youth Peace Camp 2017: Jakarta Statement," Jakarta: Religions for Peace Asia & the Pacific Interfaith Youth Network, 2017, 2.

4.6 Hinduism, Buddhism, Confucianism and Ecology

The three religions (Hinduism, Buddhism, and Confucianism) make up around 2% of the Indonesian population.¹²⁴ This group is, therefore, relatively small in Indonesia, although some of these groups form substantially large groups in certain areas. An example of this is of course the island of Bali of which according to a census conducted in 2010 approximately 81% identifies themselves as Hindu.¹²⁵

These religions are, thus, not very influential by number of citizens in the ecological discourse on a national scale. But they can be, nonetheless, very influential in certain local areas that must deal with environmental challenges. Internationally these religions are also seen as important actors within the worldwide ecological discourse, so they can still be substantially influential within the ecological discourse in Indonesia. Hinduism could be one of the most dominant groups within the discourse on environmental challenges, due to the many initiatives within this religion against the environmental challenges worldwide.

An example of this was the *Hindu Faith Statement* against the current environmental challenges. This initiative was setup in 2003 by multiple Indian leaders to show the connection between the Indian Hindu faith and topics like

124 Kementerian Agama RI, “Berdasar Jumlah Pemeluk Agama Menurut Agama,”

125 “Penduduk Menurut Wilayah dan Agama yang Dianut,” Badan Pusat Statistik, Accessed 25 April, 2019. <https://sp2010.bps.go.id/index.php/site/tabel?tid=321&wid=0>.

sustainability and the protection of the environment.¹²⁶

An Indonesian example of Hindu ecological concern was related the case around the reclamation project of Benoa Bay on Bali. In 2012, the Governor of Bali gave permits to several companies to build small islands in Benoa Bay for tourism purposes.¹²⁷ His actions were met with multiple demonstrations by the inhabitants of the surrounding village, who claimed that Benoa Bay was a holy site. This was previously confirmed by a study conducted in 2007 that stated that around 60 holy sites of religious and cultural significance existed around Benoa Bay.¹²⁸ That is why many Hindus from nearby villages around Benoa Bay demonstrated against the reclamation, due to the possible contamination of those sacred places.¹²⁹ This is just one of the examples of a Hindu environmental activist group that actively participate in the environmental discourse in the Indonesian public sphere.

Hinduism also has some key beliefs that are relevant to the ecological discourse. One of them is the Hindu belief that humans and nature are spiritually interconnected with each other.¹³⁰ Nature is seen as an “expression of divinity”,

126 “Hindu Faith Statement,” Alliance of Religions and Conservation, Accessed 25 April, 2019. <http://www.arcworld.org/faiths.asp?page-ID=77>.

127 I. Putu Gede Ardhana and Mutria Farhaeni, “The study of the impact for social culture toward the planning of reclamation for Benoa Bay in Bali,” *American Institute for Physics* 4, no.1 (2017): 3.

128 Ibid.

129 Ibid.

130 Tony Whitten, Roehayat Emon Soeriaatmadja and Suraya A Afiff, *The Ecology of Java and Bali*. The Ecology of Indonesia Series, V. 2. (Hong Kong: Periplus Editions, 1996), 839.

due to their belief that humans and nature are spiritually connected with each other. Hindus also see this within the top hierarchal spiritual beings within Hinduism.¹³¹ This cosmic view towards nature can therefore be a clear example of deep ecology within the Hindu community.

Besides this example, there are some Hindu scriptures that are referred by the worldwide Hindu community in ecological discourse. The *Moksadharmaparvan*, one of the books of the Mahabharata epos, is one of these scriptures.¹³² In this book, there is a description about a vision that shows that the human body, the spiritual world, and the natural order of the world are all connected with each other.¹³³ The *Moksadharmaparvan* is, therefore, an important scripture within Hinduism because it contains a deep ecology message for the Hindu community. Hinduism has, thus, a couple of religious concepts that could be used in advocating against environmental issues.

Buddhist views are also often referred within the worldwide ecological discourse on the environment. There are, for example, cases in major Buddhist countries around Indonesia, like Thailand and Cambodia. An example of this was an initiative by the Tzu Chi movement, an original Taiwanese Buddhist charity/relief organization, that advocated for recycling and even setup an infrastructure of recycling in Taiwan.¹³⁴ Tzu Chi has also started this kind of

131 Ibid.

132 Roger S. Gottlieb, *This Sacred Earth: Religion, Nature, Environment*, 2nd ed. Issr Library (New York: Routledge, 2004), 302.

133 Ibid.

134 C. Lee and L. Han, "Recycling Bodhisattva: The Tzu-Chi Movement's

recycling infrastructure in Indonesia, in cities like Surabaya and Medan.¹³⁵

According to Chengpang Lee and Ling Han, who wrote of the development of environmental issues being addressed by Buddhist organizations, Tzu Chi started to advocate against ecological challenges like global warming and other environmental issues during the 1990's.¹³⁶ This was after they saw the problems caused by those issues in the disasters they assisted, which led their leader to speak out for environmental protection during the 90's.¹³⁷ This, according to Lee and Han, is a clear example of the way Buddhist organizations began to address environmental challenges since the 1990's. Buddhism and environmental advocacy are, therefore, already for a couple of decennia connected with each other. Most of these Buddhist organizations draw these initiatives from their explanation of key concepts within Buddhist teachings. One of these concepts is the Buddhist concept of *Ahimsa*, which means "non-harming or non-violence".¹³⁸ This concept, according to Damien Keown, an author on Buddhism, is an

Response to Global Climate Change," *Social Compass* 62, no. 3 (2015): 312.

135 Mangunjaya, Fachruddin Majeri, Imran S.L Tobing, Andang Binawan, Evangeline Pua, and Made Nurbawa, "Faiths from the Archipelago: Action on the Environment and Climate Change," *Worldviews* 19, no. 2 (2015): 120.

136 C. Lee and L. Han, "Recycling Bodhisattva: The Tzu-Chi Movement's Response to Global Climate Change," 319.

137 C. Lee and L. Han, "Recycling Bodhisattva: The Tzu-Chi Movement's Response to Global Climate Change," 319.

138 D. Keown, "Buddhism and Ecology: A Virtue Ethics Approach," *Contemporary Buddhism* 8, no. 2 (2007): 106.

important Buddhist virtue that can be a Buddhist based to care for treatment of other creatures.¹³⁹ Other virtues within Buddhism that, according to Damien Keown, are important in the relationship between Buddhism and ecology can be seen in the following Table 2.

Table 2. Buddhist Virtues that Influence the Buddhist Mindset on Ecology According to Damien Keown.¹⁴⁰

Buddhist Virtues on Ecology	Meaning
Araga	Non-greed
Santusti	Contentment with what you have
Metta	Love
Karuna	Compassion
Mudita	Gladness
Upekkha	Equanimity

These virtues within Buddhism can, thus, influence Buddhistic views on the environment because they can be used to care more about nature and can be used to advocate for a more sustainable relationship between mankind and nature. But these virtues are not the only concept that influence Buddhistic view on ecology.

Another relevant concept is the Buddhist concept of *Prajna* or “moment in which someone gets an insight or emptiness”.¹⁴¹ According to Chin-Fa Cheng, this concept of

139 Ibid.
140 D. Keown, “Buddhism and Ecology: A Virtue Ethics Approach,” 105-106.
141 Chin-Fa Cheng, “Environmental Ontology in Deep Ecology and Ma-

Prajna is a key idea within Mahayana Buddhism, to further advocate against environmental issues by Buddhists.¹⁴² This is because *prajna* is part of the Buddhist idea of *Dharma* or “key lesson of Buddha” that can help someone to achieve enlightenment within the Mahayana tradition.¹⁴³ This key concept is, therefore, an important belief that can help Buddhists to further advocate against environmental issues. Buddhism has, thus, multiple religious concepts that can help environmental advocacy groups to challenges environmental issues.

Confucian environmental advocacy groups are more difficult to find in Indonesia. Unfortunately, after searching for a clear example of a Confucian community that clearly advocates against environmental issues there were no results. This can maybe be explained by the marginal status that Confucians had in Indonesia. Confucianism only became an organised religion in Indonesia around 1900 and after that it had a troublesome history throughout the 20th century.¹⁴⁴ Especially after the rise to power by Suharto, due to its loss of the status of a religion for legal matter round the 1980’s by his government.¹⁴⁵ This loss of status caused for a lot of discrimination against the Confucianism community in Indonesia. But this is now slightly changing. This can, thus,

ayana Buddhism,” *Environmental Ethics* 38, no. 2 (2016): 158.

142 Ibid.

143 Ibid.

144 Timothy Lindsey, Helen Pausacker and Charles A. Coppel, *Chinese Indonesians: Remembering, Distorting, Forgetting*, (Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 2005), 79.

145 Timothy Lindsey, Helen Pausacker and Charles A. Coppel, *Chinese Indonesians: Remembering, Distorting, Forgetting*, 82.

maybe be a reason why there is not really a Confucianist community that advocated against environmental challenges or visible group that does this. But it can maybe also be explained by its relatively small community with around 0,03% of the total population.¹⁴⁶

Yet Confucianism has some key beliefs that are relevant the ecological discourse. According to Jan Erik Christensen, an author on Confucianism, there are, for instance, some key Confucian ethics that can be used to further advocate for more food sustainability and the sustainability of other resources.¹⁴⁷ In his article on Confucianism and sustainable ethics, Christensen showed that there are a couple of sayings by Confucius and his followers that can be used in discourses around food and resources sustainability. One of such sayings is from Mencius, a follower of Confucius. According to Christensen this Mencius advocated to use natural resources with moderation and warn people, so they wouldn't influence nature too much.¹⁴⁸

"If you do not allow nets with too fine a mesh to be used in large ponds, then there will be more fish and turtles than they can eat; if hatchets and axes are permitted in the forests on the hills only in the proper seasons, then there will be more timber than they can use." (Mencius 1A.3; Lau 2003, p. 7).¹⁴⁹

146 Kementeriaan Agama RI, "Berdasar Jumlah Pemeluk Agama Menurut Agama,"

147 Jan Erik Christensen, "Confucianism, Food, and Sustainability," *Asian Philosophy* 27, no. 1 (2017): 28.

148 Jan Erik Christensen, "Confucianism, Food, and Sustainability," 24.

149 Ibid.

This clearly shows that Confucians could use sayings from Confucius or his followers in topics relating the environmental challenges because some of those sayings address the relationship between humans and nature. This saying, for instance, calls for a more sustainable relationship between mankind and nature.

But this is not the only key concept that Confucians could use in discourses relating to environmental issues. They could, for example, also use an old philosophical Confucianist vision that *Heaven, Earth, and Humanity* in unity with each other.¹⁵⁰ This cosmological view could, for instance, be used to address the importance of nature for mankind and its own intrinsic value in relationship to this unity idea in Confucianism. According to John Berthrong, an author on Confucianism and ecology, this cosmological view is still not fully being used by Confucian thinkers. Berthrong, for instance, stated that most Confucian thinkers address “social wrongs” instead of addressing the Confucian cosmological ideas that can induce Confucians to further be more careful with the environment.¹⁵¹ Yet, although this is not fully implemented within the Confucianist world, it can still be a relevant concept for further Confucian thinkers and environmental advocacy groups, because they can still use these cosmological ideas in their campaigns.

150 Roger S. Gottlieb, *The Oxford Handbook of Religion and Ecology*, Oxford Handbooks, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), 250.

151 Roger S. Gottlieb, *The Oxford Handbook of Religion and Ecology*, Oxford Handbooks, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), 251.

4.7 Hinduism, Buddhism, Confucianism, and Interreligious Dialogue

These three religions are also somewhat connected to interreligious initiatives in Indonesia. An example of this was of course the *Interfaith Rainforest Initiative*, in which multiple NGO's and FBO's with different religious backgrounds, including Hinduism and Buddhism partook in to address the deforestation in Indonesia.¹⁵²

There are also some Buddhist interreligious initiatives in Indonesia with other religious groups. In 2018, the Tzu Chi Indonesia organization, a local branch of Buddhist relief organization, for example, signed a memorandum of understanding (MoU) with the largest Muslim organization in Indonesia, Nahdlatul Ulama.¹⁵³ In this MoU, they agreed to cooperate with each other on topics like disaster management, education, but also on environmental conservation. This shows, thus, that a Buddhist relief organization is now working together with the biggest Muslim relief organization on topic relating the environmental challenges in Indonesia. The successfulness of this interreligious initiative is, of course, still under debate because this MoU was only signed one year before this review. But it is of course a promising

152 “Religious leaders join interfaith rainforest initiative in Oslo today,” The Forum on Religion and Ecology at Yale, Accessed April 23, 2019, <http://fore.yale.edu/news/item/religious-leaders-join-inter-faith-rainforest-initiative-in-oslo-today/>.

153 “Tzu Chi Partners with the Largest Islamic Organisation in Indonesia,” Tzu Chi, Accessed 25 April 2019. <https://www.tzuchi.org.sg/en/news-and-stories/global-presence/tzu-chi-partners-with-the-largest-islamic-organisation-in-indonesia/>.

start for further interreligious cooperation between Tzu Chi and Nahdlatul Ulama.

Confucianist groups that are involved within interreligious initiatives around the ecological discourse in Indonesia are still rare. A good example of a Confucianist group that is involved within the interreligious dialogue on the environment is the Majelis Tinggi Agama Khonghucu Indonesia (Matakin) or the *Supreme Council for the Confucian Religion in Indonesia*. This council signed a declaration with other FBO's like Muhammadiyah and Nahdlatul Ulama (two Muslim organizations), Persatuan Gereja Indonesia [PGI] (a Christian organization) and Perwakilan Umat Buddha Indonesia [Walubi] (Buddhist organization) to advocate for a more sustainable world on the *World Earth Day* in 2015.¹⁵⁴ Bigger Confucianist groups like Matakin thus cooperated with other religious FBO's, like Muhammadiyah, to advocate against the current environmental issues in Indonesia.

But the frequency and amount of these types of interreligious initiatives on a local level in Indonesia are hard to count due to the limited time for this review. Yet even though it is hard to really pinpoint how much of these interreligious initiatives are already around in Indonesia, it is still a promising start of a bigger interreligious dialogue on the environment in Indonesia.

154 Maria Fatima Bona, "Peringati Hari Perdamaian Dunia, Tokoh Lintas Agama Deklarasi Siaga Bumi," *Berita Satu*, September 15, 2015. <https://www.beritasatu.com/kesra/308682-peringati-hari-perdamaian-dunia-tokoh-lintas-agama-deklarasi-siaga-bumi.html>.

4.8 Indigenous Religion and Ecology

Indigenous religion is a complicate category of religion in Indonesia. The constitution excludes indigenous religious from the six recognized religions, but in reality indigenous belief is still exists in many parts of the country, Although this group is minority in Indonesia, they still have a highly influential impact on the environmental discourses in Indonesia. An example of this can be given with the help of an ecofeminist activist group from Kendeng, East Java, which was based around a Javanese indigenous group called the Saminist or Sedulur Sikep.¹⁵⁵ This group advocated against the cement industry around their native area due to the water pollution that this industry caused in the Kendeng area.¹⁵⁶ The group, eventually, got a lot of attention by the Indonesian media even by CNN Indonesia.¹⁵⁷

Another indigenous group that was active within an environmental discourse were the Batak from Northern Sumatra. In 2017, around 1.300 people from a local Batak community around Lake Toba demonstrated in Balige, North Sumatra, for land rights of a national forest in their

155 Primi Suharmadhi Putri, "Re-Claiming Lost Possessions: A Study of the Javanese Samin (Sedulur Sikep) Movement to maintain their Peasant Identity and Access to Resources" (Master Thesis., University of Oslo, 2017), 3.

156 Suherdjoko. "Kendeng farmers blockade cement factory," *The Jakarta Post*. February 11, 2017. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2017/02/11/kendeng-farmers-blockade-cement-factory.html>.

157 Tiara Sutari, "Ganjar dan Sudirman Ditantang Bernyali Bahas Semen Kendeng," *CNN Indonesia*, June 5, 2018. <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/pilkadaserentak/nasional/20180503071647-32-295292/ganjar-dan-sudirman-ditantang-bernyali-bahas-semen-kendeng>.

area.¹⁵⁸ According to this group, the national forest area in their communities was being polluted by pulp plantations/mills and they wanted the Indonesian government to know that they ought the government to step in and banish these plantation companies from the national forest.¹⁵⁹ One more example of an indigenous group that is involved within the ecological discourse in Indonesia are the Iban from Kalimantan/Borneo. Some communities within the larger Iban community advocate for the conservation of the forests on Kalimantan.¹⁶⁰

Indigenous communities are, thus, heavily involved within the current debates on environmental challenges in Indonesia. Like the trend worldwide, indigenous groups are often at the centre of advocacy against the current environmental challenges. The indigenous communities are also often romanticised in the environmental discourses and can, therefore, have a big impact on the public discourses throughout the world on the environmental challenges debate.¹⁶¹ This is especially prevalent in global discourses that aim to address the importance of the environmental for

158 Brihannala Morgan, "1300 people protest for land rights, against Toba Pulp Lestari in Indonesia!" *Rainforest Action Network*, Accessed 25 April, 2019. https://www.ran.org/the-understory/tpl_landrights_protest/.

159 Ibid.

160 Severianus Endi, "Forest conservation on the Malaysia-Indonesia border," *The Jakarta Post*, September 25, 2018. <https://www.thejakar-tapost.com/life/2018/09/25/forest-conservation-on-the-malaysia-indonesia-border.html>

161 John M. Edington, *Indigenous Environmental Knowledge: Reappraisal* (Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2017), 1, <https://www.springer.com/gp/book/9783319624907>.

peoples that live closely with nature. This can be partially explained by some religious beliefs within these indigenous communities that attract transnational supports outside these communities.¹⁶²

Initiatives from indigenous peoples against environmental challenges can, therefore, be very effective in certain public spheres, due to their perceived image in many societies. A clear example of this are the religious beliefs and practices from the Samin in Central Java to which a couple of Kendeng activist belong to. The Samin, for instance, believe that women are more affected environmental damages than men.¹⁶³ This is because women in Samin communities have more interaction with nature than men, due to their domestic lives in Samin culture and the Samin people also have a kind of spiritual believe in a mother-earth.¹⁶⁴ Women are thus important in the Samin belief system around ecology because, in their belief, women are necessary in the balance with nature.¹⁶⁵ This, in turn, can make them very popular among other ecofeminist groups around the world, due to this spiritual belief.

Another important worldview belief that is very important to remember when addressing indigenous religions are about

162 Lewis Williams, Rose Alene Roberts, and Alastair McIntosh, *Radical Human Ecology: Intercultural and Indigenous Approaches*, (Farnham, Surrey, England: Ashgate Pub. Company, 2011), 24.

163 Primi Suharmadhi Putri, "Re-Claiming Lost Possessions: A Study of the Javanese Samin (Sedulur Sikep) Movement to maintain their Peasant Identity and Access to Resources" (Master Thesis., University of Oslo, 2017), 55.

164 Ibid.

165 Ibid.

their cosmologies.¹⁶⁶ Many of the indigenous religions have, for instance, a cosmology that emphasizes an interconnectedness between mankind and nature. Most indigenous religions have, for example, environmental morals intertwined within their religious beliefs that make environment an important aspect of their life.¹⁶⁷

This is understandable because of the importance of the environment for these types of communities, as they are highly dependence on nature to provide them food, clothes, and other kind of commodities.¹⁶⁸ The status of their environment is, thus, an important aspect that forms up a big portion of their religious belief system. This makes their cosmologies also very popular by environmental advocacy groups. Nonetheless, according to George Tinker, there is also a danger in this. This is especially the case when non-indigenous peoples romanticize their practices and religious traditions to address environmental challenges.¹⁶⁹ Although indigenous communities are less influential in comparison to other faiths like Islam and Christianity, they can still have a big impact on the environmental discourses, especially when they advocate in the international discourses on the environment.

166 Bernard T. Adeney, ed. *Dealing with Diversity: Religion, Globalization, Violence, Gender and Disaster in Indonesia*, Globethics.net Focus, No. 17, (Geneva, Switzerland: Globethics.net, 2014), 332.

167 Lewis Williams, Rose Alene Roberts, and Alastair McIntosh, *Radical Human Ecology: Intercultural and Indigenous Approaches*, 24.

168 Lewis Williams, Rose Alene Roberts, and Alastair McIntosh, *Radical Human Ecology: Intercultural and Indigenous Approaches*, 24.

169 Whitney Bauman, Richard Bohannon and Kevin O'Brien. *Grounding Religion: A Field Guide to the Study of Religion and Ecology*. (Hoboken: Taylor & Francis, 2010), 41.

4.9 Indigenous Religion and Interreligious Dialogue

Indigenous religions are often excluded in interreligious dialogue initiatives in Indonesia. But this does not mean that those interreligious initiatives with indigenous religion are absent Indonesian religious life. The main reason why there are not much involved in many cases of interreligious initiatives probably the perception of indigenous belief as a different category from religion in Indonesia. Many of the indigenous religions in Indonesia, for instance, are not fully acknowledged as religions but rather as cultures.¹⁷⁰ Which can, in turn, cause for interreligious initiatives to overlook these types of indigenous religions in their dialogues on the environmental challenges.

In addition, it can also be explained by their loose organizational structures. Many of these indigenous religions in Indonesia do not have the same strong FBO's like, for instance, Islam and Christianity that can advocate their stand in the Indonesian public sphere. Because interreligious dialogues with indigenous religions' involvement in interfaith initiatives on environment relatively rare, their participation in interfaith initiatives on environment at the international level is also limited.

One example of this is an interreligious initiative which combined interreligious religions was the *Interfaith*

170 Zainal Abidin Bagir, "The "Relation" Between Science and Religion in the Pluralistic Landscape of Today's World," *Zygon* 50, no. 2 (2015): 414.

Rainforest Initiative led by a committee from the United Nations. This *Interfaith Rainforest Initiative* invited religious leaders from all major world religions like Islam, Christianity, Hinduism, and Buddhism, as well as religious leaders from indigenous religions in countries like Colombia, Brazil, and Indonesia in 2017 in Oslo.¹⁷¹ It was, thus, more a kind of an international interreligious dialogue than a national interreligious dialogue in the Indonesian public sphere. But it was nonetheless an example of an interreligious initiative in which indigenous religion leaders from Indonesia participated in. Although indigenous religions are thus sometimes overlooked in Indonesia in the discourse on ecology, they can still be a very important group to include in the interreligious initiatives on the environment.

The inclusion of indigenous religions on a local level is, however, still a problematic one and time will only tell if there would be more interreligious initiatives that include the Indonesian indigenous religions. Indigenous communities like those around Kendeng and North Sumatra, but also other communities throughout Indonesia could be a key factor in mainstreaming the environmental challenges among the Indonesian society. Especially since those communities have a history fighting against colonialism and all her aspects like modern capitalism in Indonesia. Their image could, therefore, be highly effective in the national landscape

171 Liz Kimbrough, "Religious leaders mobilize to protect indigenous people and forests," *Mongabay*, May 2, 2018, <https://news.mongabay.com/2018/05/religious-leaders-mobilize-to-protect-indigenous-people-and-forests/>.

of Indonesia because they have a history of questioning environmental problems since colonial times. Integrating these communities in the environmental discourse in Indonesia could, therefore, possibly be highly effective in mainstreaming it to a bigger audience.

05.

THE POSSIBILITIES FOR THE PUBLIC SPHERE

5.1 Introduction

THE previous chapter's discussion on examples of religious and interreligious initiatives on ecology within the Indonesian public sphere leaves a question what possibilities can these kinds of initiatives provide for the public sphere in Indonesia? This chapter addresses this with the help of an overview of the possibilities of interreligious dialogue on ecology for the Indonesian public sphere with the help of some examples and statements of experts that were interviewed for this literature review.

This is important to address, since this can help strengthening the public discourse on environmental issues in Indonesia, by offering some illustrations on how religion can be implemented by certain influential groups in the Indonesian public sphere. The chapter is divided into five paragraphs in which the implications for NGO's, businesses, government agencies, and faith-based organisations (FBOs) are addressed.

5.2 Faith-Based Organizations

What kind of possibilities can religious beliefs and values from these religions provide for the public sphere? To answer this question, this section first starts with the possible benefits faith-based organizations (FBO's) can have when using these values and beliefs in the public discourse on the environmental challenges.

The first benefit for FBO's is mainly based on their potential to mobilize their followers to act towards an issue in the society. The two largest Muslim FBO's in Indonesia, the Muhammadiyah and Nadhlatul Ulama, are clear examples of this in Indonesia. This is because both Islamic FBO's already use some religious beliefs and values within their religion to spread awareness on multiple environmental issues. One clear example of this was, of course, the campaign of both FBO's in cooperation with Greenpeace and the government during the Ramadan of 2018 to spread awareness on the plastic management issue in Indonesia in the mosques.¹⁷² Although there are not key figures that show in which amount the awareness has spread after their initiative, it still shows that FBO's can collaborate into a single campaign based on one religious' community.

An FBO can of course raise a lot of awareness among the followers of their same religion. But it can also be a way in which FBO's can stay relevant for the society. This is because the environmental issues are a big topic among the

172 "Appealing to Indonesia's Muslims", *Qantara*, Accessed April 23, 2019, <https://en.qantara.de/content/islam-and-single-use-plastics-ap-pealing-to-indonesias-muslims>.

newer generations in Indonesia. A clear example of this was a case study among 329 high school students in Central Java conducted by Roshayanti, Wicaksono, and Minarti called “How Indonesian students think about environment: Case study at North Coastal Central Java, Indonesia”. The results from their research indicate that growing awareness among younger generation of the importance to protect their environment.¹⁷³ This makes the environmental issue highly important to further increase the importance of a FBO’s influence in a society.

Another big benefit that an FBO can have is mainly based on their willingness to work together with other FBO’s outside their religion. This is apparent, for instance, in the collaboration between Tzu Chi Indonesia (a Confucianist FBO) and Nadhlatul Ulama in 2018.¹⁷⁴ Both FBO’s worked together in an interreligious way to further strengthen their position within the society on topics relating to the environment, in addition to other topics like education and disaster management. This, in turn, can contribute to a positive image boost for both FBO’s because it can decrease the distrust and other unsettling emotions between both religions in Indonesia.

173 F. Roshayanti, A.G.C Wicaksono, I.B. Minarti, and International Conference on Mathematics and Science Education 2018 ICMSCE 2018, “How Indonesian Students Think About Environment: Case Study at North Coastal Central Java, Indonesia,” *Journal of Physics: Conference Series* 1157, no. 2 (2019): 2-3.

174 “Tzu Chi Partners with the Largest Islamic Organisation in Indonesia,” Tzu Chi, Accessed 25 April, 2019. <https://www.tzuchi.org.sg/en/news-and-stories/global-presence/tzu-chi-partners-with-the-largest-islamic-organisation-in-indonesia/>.

It is noteworthy, however, that this benefit is mainly based around the top layer of the society, like the academic part of the society and people that activity follow the activities of the FBO's. This, of course, does not represent all segments of society in Indonesia. Some FBO's like Muhammadiyah, for example, do a lot of efforts promoting for environment protection, but that does not make their initiatives under the concern of all Muslims in Indonesia. Nonetheless, FBO's can, thus, be influential to further tackle environmental issues faced by Indonesia societies in this current moment, especially since religious communities are still being a corner stone for their society.¹⁷⁵ However, the roles of FBSs are still largely limited withing their community. Therefore, in a way religious values and beliefs on the environment can serve as a bonding social capital among the members and participants of a particular FBO because it creates a common religious language. Their influence on larger external community remains to be seen.

Aside from the above possibilities, there also some problematic aspects for the roles of FBO's to use religious values and beliefs on the environment in their campaigns. FBO's reference their doctrine, for example, may only apply to their own religious group and not bind other religious followers on the same religious values and beliefs that they themselves have on the environment. This tends to exclude other religious people their campaigns when they use this

175 Handi Hadiwitanto, *Religion and Generalised Trust: An Empirical-Theological Study among University Students in Indonesia*, Ph.D. diss., 2016. Lit Verlag, 2016.

type of religious concepts on the environment. It can also be an obstacle when activists seek to incorporate other secular NGO's in their campaign against environmental issues. This is especially the case when members of those NGO's have conflicting views or questions about their religious values on an environmental issue.

The possibilities of FBO's to play roles on the environmental campaigns will especially critical when they have a particular case in a certain area where their religious beliefs and values can help to further increase the awareness on the environmental issues. They also need to be aware of other religious groups within the society if they want to increase awareness on a certain environmental issue. This is because in many areas in Indonesia are more plural in term religious demography and, therefore, require religious communities to work together. Interreligious dialogues could reach more participants then only the ones from their own religious background.

It is important, therefore, that religious actors mainly speak in a general way on environmental issues like water pollution in which they show in which way the people will be impacted by those environmental issues. This can create more awareness then just talking and discussing one religious traditions and view with each other. FBO's can thus have a lot of possibilities when using religious values and beliefs on the environmental campaigns.

This was one point most of the experts interviewed for this research agreed upon. They share the view that that

most of the big Muslim FBO's are already highly involved in this discourse. They also suggest that they thought that FBO's should play a big role in advocating against environmental issues because they could have a big impact on the religious communities in Indonesia. This is especially essential on the Muslim community considering Nadhlatul Ulama, for example, has a lot of followers in Indonesia. But they also had some remarks regarding FBO's. Some experts for example stated that they also thought that FBO's could have some limitations in this advocacy.

A couple of experts, for example, stated that they thought that they were not sure if FBO's could use interreligious dialogues or initiatives in their advocacy campaign. This is because they thought that FBO's were most often occupied by the theological aspect of environmental issues. This made their efforts according to some of the scholars and practitioners interviewed for this review somewhat sceptic about their role in bigger advocacy movements.

Therefore, they suggest that their influence would be mostly based around elite discourses among the academics and religious leaders since those discourse would not work that well with the common citizens. Therefore, they thought that the FBO's should mostly spread their message among local religious communities, like in churches and mosques, including pesantrens or the Islamic boarding schools in Indonesia. The experts note, for instance that there were eco-pesantrens present in some part of Java that already teach Islamic virtues about nature and against

environmental problems. Since pesantren is a prominent educational institution for most of the Muslims in Indonesia, they thought that FBO's like Muhammadiyah and Nadhlatul Ulama could further setup such schools to further spread a message against environmental issues among the Muslim community.

There are, thus, multiple ways in which FBO's, especially Islamic FBO's, could advocate against environmental destruction in Indonesia. The use of interreligious dialogues or initiatives in this topic is, however, still problematic and would be mostly done by the elite segment of the society. This makes interreligious dialogues or initiatives mostly a concern among the top part of the Indonesian society and is not really a functional method to address the environmental issues at the grassroot level.

5.3 Non-Governmental Organizations

NGOs can also benefit from combining religious beliefs and values to further spread their environmental campaign in Indonesia. Some NGOs, like *Greenpeace*, are already combining religion in their campaigns. An example of this was of course the anti-plastic campaign in 2018 during Ramadan. In this campaign, they worked together with the Islamic FBOs Muhammadiyah and Nadhlatul Ulama. But these types of cooperation between FBOs and NGOs are mostly elitist because most of their initiatives are not yet present in the mainstream society. This can become a major issue since

a problem with such elitist initiatives are that they cannot create the topics of environmental issue to a mainstream audience.

This was also one concern of interreligious dialogue initiatives that was present in Malaysia.¹⁷⁶ Elitist initiatives, for instance, use various jargons and religious rhetorics that are not always understandable by the common citizens.¹⁷⁷ That is why such initiatives do not always use to get their message over to other common citizens what could be of course a lost change of such initiatives.

While interreligious dialogues can help to create bridging and bonding capital among certain groups on a topic like the environmental issues, it does not always help to create more awareness about this topic. However, this does not make those initiatives completely ineffective because, although they cannot always get the common people on board, they can create a common bases among the religious leaders to try, at least, to create more awareness among their communities. This can be, for instance, very effective on a local level.

An example of this was the study on religious advocacy against bushmeat among Church in North-Sulawesi in response to the way religious leaders in the churches there advocated against an issue like overhunting on bats in that area. This type of religious advocacy could create more

176 Wan Sabri Wan Yusof and Arfah Ab Majid, "Inter-Religious Dialogue Models in Malaysia," *Global Journal Al-Thaqafah* 2, no. 1 (2012): 1.

177 Wan Sabri Wan Yusof and Arfah Ab Majid, "Inter-Religious Dialogue Models in Malaysia," 2.

awareness not only among the younger generations who are already aware of this topic but also among the elder generation.¹⁷⁸ On a local level, a cooperation between NGOs and religious communities or FBOs could, therefore, be very effective when tackling one certain issue in the broader environmental challenges discourse. NGOs could thus benefit from using the religious values and beliefs of people in a certain area because it can create a common language between the NGOs goals and the ideas and beliefs of the people that they want to change.

For this to be effective, instead of creating grievances among the people whose habits maybe affected, it is very important to be sensitive to the issues the community has to face and learn to "speak" in the cultural and religious paradigms of those peoples. NGOs can, therefore, explore possibilities for their environmental awareness campaigns when using religious values and beliefs. NGOs could then use the religious values and beliefs to "speak" in the cultural and religious paradigms of the people they want to help.

This view is common among experts interviewed for this research. Most of them were very positive about the way NGOs refer to religion to further spread their message against environmental issues. They could, for example, work together with churches and mosques to spread local campaign against certain issues, in addition collaborative initiatives with FBOs, like Nadhlatul Ulama. Some experts

178 Sheherazade and Susan M Tsang, "Quantifying the Bat Bushmeat Trade in North Sulawesi, Indonesia, with Suggestions for Conservation Action," *Global Ecology and Conservation* 3 (2015): 329.

also stated that interreligious aspects of such initiatives would also have some limitations. This is because on some local levels in Indonesia there is not that much of religious diversity that require interreligious initiatives against environmental issues. NGOs should, therefore, be aware of the religious demographic in certain areas in Indonesia to focus on multiple religions. This is important because some areas are not religious diverse enough for interreligious initiatives or dialogues.

Another issue that became a concern for some of the experts is the perception about of international organizations among local government, which sometimes not make them less influential in changing environmental regulations. Indonesian based NGOs are more often perceived better by the government. An example of this was Wahana Lingkungan Hidup Indonesia (WALHI, *Indonesian's Forum for the Environment*). According to some experts this Indonesian based NGO had strong influence on the local politics and are already referring religion in their advocacy against environmental issues. The Indonesian based NGOs like WALHI could, therefore, have a big role in tackling the environmental challenges and use religion in their advocacy. NGOs could thus benefit in multiple ways by using religion in their advocacy against Environmental challenges.

5.4 Businesses

Many are often sceptical on the possibility of business sector work with religious communities to further spread awareness on the environmental issues. Business sector

are often perceived as the main cause for the current environmental challenges due to their direct impact on nature. But there are some companies that want to raise more awareness on the environmental challenges to boost their sales for alternative products against more polluting products.

An example of this is the local Yogyakarta chocolate company named *Monggo*. The leader of this company said that it is committed to reduce their pollution produced by the chocolate production. Therefore, they only use local ingredients near Yogyakarta to reduce the air pollution from transportation and use recycled paper for their packaging.¹⁷⁹ There are also instances of tourism companies throughout Indonesia that lean to ecotourism as a way to advocate against environmental issues like deforestation to improve their ecotourism branch. These business sector could possibly look to religious beliefs or values to further increase their market. This is especially important for companies that sell *halal* products.

Such a direction can be seen, for example, in the so-called *eco-halal* movement in Europe and North America among the Muslim community there.¹⁸⁰ This movement uses religious interpretations to advocate for better environmental food products. Some companies that target religious communities like the Muslim communities could,

179 "The spirit of Monggo," Monggo, Accessed 25e April, 2019. <http://chocolatemonngo.com/about-monggo/>.

180 Febe Armanios and Bogăc, A Ergene, *Halal Food: A History* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2018), 8.

therefore, refer to some religious values or beliefs to further advertise for environmentally friendly products. This approach can also be relevant for other religious communities like Christians, Hindus, or Buddhists that could be targeted in the advertisement campaigns around their religious festivals to sell eco-friendly products. There are, thus, a couple of possibilities for business to use religious values or beliefs in their activities but not that many. Business sector could, therefore, incorporate religious values when advocating against environmental issues and in their effort to advertise for the environmental ways of their company.

These initial evidences may counter the scepticism among the experts who may not be aware if business had the ethical background to change their environmental stands. Some experts perceive most corporations as the cause of the current environmental challenges in Indonesia and this explain why they were not optimistic possible change of behaviour among the corporation. Yet some experts saw also some possibilities for business in using religion when they really wanted to act in an eco-friendly way. One expert, for example, stated that business that focus on the Muslim community and sell *halal* product could, for instance, promote their products as environmentally friendly *halal* products.

Another possibility for business that they come up with was for advertisement purposes. One of the interviewed experts, for instance, stated that he thought businesses could sponsor religious initiatives like eco-pesantrens to

increase the view of people that they are concerned with the environment. Although these are some ways in which businesses could use religion against environmental issues, it is still a mostly unexplored topic by the academical world. Time will only tell if businesses could really influence the environmental discourse. But there are still some promising ways in which they could influence it.

5.5 Government

As a country where religion occupies an important place in public life, it is important that the Indonesian government incorporate religious values or beliefs to raise awareness on the current environmental issues. The government institutions are already well connected to religious institutions, and they could, therefore, just use already existing connections with those communities and FBOs. This is evidence, for example, in Indonesian government support for the initiative in 2018 during Ramadan with Muhammadiyah and Nadhlatul Ulama to address the plastic waste problem in Indonesia.¹⁸¹ In other occasions, the government already refer to religious values or beliefs through the FBOs in Indonesia to raise awareness against environmental challenges.

This evidence is promising sign for environmental advocacy groups as it shows the beginning from the government to further raise awareness on this topic. This is not only possible for the ministry of religious affairs, but also

181 “Appealing to Indonesia’s Muslims”, *Qantara*, Accessed April 23, 2019, <https://en.qantara.de/content/islam-and-single-use-plastics-appealing-to-indonesias-muslims>.

other ministries, like the ministry of the environment. Both ministries have been involved the green or eco-pesantren initiatives. This shows that the government is already aware about the important of combining religion in their advocacy against the current environmental struggles in Indonesia.

The experts that were interviewed, especially those who participated into one or more eco-pesantrens or NGOs about environmental issues, stated that the Indonesian government are already in some parts working with the advocacy against environmental issues. Some of the experts stated, for example, that some ministries, like the Ministry for Forest and Environment, are already supporting eco-pesantrens with money.

But there are also some remarks to be made around this. One expert stated, for example, that one minister of the current cabinet wanted to go to the Pope to ask him for help against an embargo of the EU against the palm oil industry in Indonesia. This indicates that this minister was not aware that the Pope was also against environmental issues as the Pope issued *Laudato Si* just before he wanted to go to the Pope. Some higher political leaders in Indonesia are not always informed about the environmental stands of religious leaders according to his expert.

Another remark that the experts gave was that the current political parties in Indonesia are not really campaigning against environmental challenges in their election campaigns. Additionally, political parties in Indonesia are not really invested into this topic, which makes

it still quite hard to mainstream this issue in Indonesia. Nonetheless, there the discussion above have shown the many possibilities of NGOs, government, and business sectors may work with religious organizations in their advocacy against environmental issues.

CONCLUSION

THIS literature review has shown emerging cases of environmental campaigns in various sectors in Indonesia and religion occupy an important place in this advocacy. Influential religious communities and FBOs are entering into the picture of campaigns to raise awareness on environmental protection. This can be critical since they are big influencers within the Indonesian society. Other influencers of the Indonesian public sphere, like the government and the NGOs, are also already collaborating with the FBOs in their efforts to spread further awareness on the current environmental challenges.

An important development to follow is the fact that key FBOs, like Muhammadiyah and Nadhlatul Ulama, are already leading interreligious initiatives to further spread a message against environmental damage. However, most of these initiatives are segregated and only focus on the academics or religious leaders to further spread a message against environmental issues. Interreligious dialogues or initiatives on this topic, thus, need to be expanded to reach broader in segment of Indonesian population. This is important since

interreligious dialogues or initiatives do not have to limit their audience to religious communities' current environmental issues are a universal concern. As some argue that the current environmental issues are a cause of a lack of a moral standard on the environment, religion can play important role to create a new kind of ethics on the environment. Most of the people in Indonesia are not yet aware with this issue and the first step to tackle this problem is to raise further awareness on this issue.

This a role academics and public leaders like religious leaders can play. Interreligious initiatives like the *Interfaith Rainforest Initiative* could provide a good platform to further spread awareness on this topic through the religious communities in Indonesia. Another possibility for an interreligious dialogue on ecology in Indonesia may occur around the interreligious initiatives in general in Indonesia. The topic of ecology or environmental challenges could, for example, be a very interesting theme for further interreligious dialogues or initiatives in general. Everyone has to face the current environmental challenges, it can, thus, be a fraternizing topic to further increase the interreligious dialogues among the Indonesian population. This topic could, therefore, be a very good example of a way in which a common concern could create bridging social capital among the people. This possibility is clear as there are, thus, multiple interreligious dialogue or initiatives on ecology in Indonesia and they are also already present in Indonesia. It remains to be seen if these initiatives will be successful, because most of these initiatives are just emerging throughout Indonesia.

RECOMMENDATIONS

ALTHOUGH there has been an increase in the amount of interest in the subject of religion and ecology and interreligious dialogues, there are still some areas within this topic that haven't been explored. This is quite strange since interreligious dialogues and initiatives on environmental issues could in theory have a lot of practical implications. This is also remarkable given the fact that both subjects have a strong relation with each other as can be seen in the amount of examples in this review. This topic of research is, thus, still understudied, and more research should be conducted on this subject considering the practical implications of interreligious initiatives in the bigger environmental discourse. Hopefully this literature review can be a starting point for further research regarding this subject.

Particular topics to explore include the practical implications for the public sphere has not received sufficient academic attention. Some areas that are, for example, still

understudied within this topic is first the sociological implications of NGOs and FBOs within public discourses. Little is known about the way in which both FBOs and NGOs influence public discourses on the environment. Most of the literature that is available is focussed on North America and Europe. There is still little known about the connection between NGOs/ FBOs and the public discourse on the environment in Southeast Asia and other parts of the world. They are, furthermore, also mostly understudied by empirical research as well.

Another thing that is understudied are the *adat* communities and Confucianist communities in relation to religious advocacy against environmental challenges, especially on their interreligious efforts in Indonesia. There seems to be very little literature on both religions in Indonesia. Even though both religious communities are quite small in comparison to other religious communities like Islam or Christianity, they can still have a big impact on the public discourse on environmental challenges.

The influence that religious advocacy can have on businesses and the government is also rather understudied. Most scholars relating this topic, conduct research on religious communities and religious organizations like FBOs. That is why the practical implications of religious advocacy against environmental challenges for businesses and governments alike is still understudied. This is unfortunate since both could be important partners in the public discourse on the environment. Environmental changes can

only be done when both are willing to advocate against environmental challenges. Religion can be an important factor in this, as shown by the social capital theory, it should, therefore, be more explored by the academical world.

Another area of research that need be done is increasing the knowledge about interreligious dialogue and eco-religious views among non-scholars and actors within this discourse. Environmental challenges affect us all and in all likelihood, religion will play a role in the advocacy against those challenges. This is especially the case in societies like Indonesia, where religion plays a big role. Be it through public campaigns by FBOs, by the religious interpretations of those who are affected by environmental challenges or through political and religious exploitations of this topic by political and religious leaders alike.

Actors involved into the environmental discourse like environmental advocacy groups need to be aware of the possibilities and limitations of religious advocacy to avoid unwanted attention or even conflicts. If actors fail to pay any attention to religion in areas where religion is a major part of the daily lives of the local community it will be very hard without any religious advocacy to advocate against environmental issues.

In contrary, if actors are over focused on this topic, it could also be a cause for further conflicts. As shown by the limitations of the social capital theory, actors within this discourse like members of FBOs/NGOs, scholars and religious/political leaders should, therefore, be very aware

of the possibilities and limitations. In this way, religious and secular actors within the environmental advocacy could form a stronger front against the current environmental challenges that Indonesia and the rest of the world currently must face.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abdelzaher, Dina M, Amr Kotb, and Akrum Helfaya. "Eco-Islam: Beyond the Principles of why and What, and into the Principles of how." *Journal of Business Ethics* 155, no. 3 (2019): 623-43.

Adeney, Bernard T, ed. *Dealing with Diversity: Religion, Globalization, Violence, Gender and Disaster in Indonesia*. Globethics.net Focus, No. 17. Geneva, Switzerland: Globethics.net, 2014.

Afnaf, Muhammad Iqbal. "Socio-Ethical Origin of Multiculturalism in Indonesia," in *Multiculturalism in Asia-Peace and Harmony*, 126-143. Bangkok: Konrad Adenauer Stiftung, 2018.

Aldridge, Alan. *Religion in the Contemporary World*. Cambridge: Polity, 2007.

Alliance of Religions and Conservation. "Hindu Faith Statement." Accessed 25 April, 2019. <http://www.arcworld.org/faiths.asp?pageID=77>.

Ardhana, I. Putu Gede, and Mutria Farhaeni. "The study of the impact for social culture toward the planning of

- reclamation for Benoa Bay in Bali.” *American Institute for Physics* 4, no.1 (2017): 1-9.
- Armanios, Febe, and Bogăc, A Ergene. *Halal Food: A History*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2018.
- Author unknown. “Religions for Peace Asia Interfaith Youth Peace Camp 2017: Jakarta Statement.” Jakarta: Religions for Peace Asia & the Pacific Interfaith Youth Network, 2017. Accessed 23 April, 2019. <https://rfp.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/04/RfP-Asia-Interfaith-Youth-Peace-Camp-2017-Statement-003.pdf>.
- Author unknown. *Faiths and the Environment: World Bank Support 2000-05*. Washington: The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/ The World Bank, 2006. Accessed 23 April, 2019. <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/GLOBALENVIRONMENTFACILITYGEFOPERATIONS/Resources/Publications-Presentations/EAPFaith&Environment.pdf>.
- Badan Pusat Statistik. “Penduduk menurut Wilayah dan Agama yang Dianut.” Accessed 25 April, 2019. <https://sp2010.bps.go.id/index.php/site/tabel?tid=321&wid=0>.
- Bagir, Zainal Abidin. “The Importance of Religion and Ecology in Indonesia.” *Worldviews: Global Religions, Culture, and Ecology* 19, no. 2 (2015): 99-102.
- Bagir, Zainal Abidin. “The “Relation” Between Science and Religion in the Pluralistic Landscape of Today’s World.” *Zygon* 50, no. 2 (2015): 403-418.

- Baldwin, Claudia, and Helen Ross. "Bridging Troubled Waters: Applying Consensus-Building Techniques to Water Planning." *Society and Natural Resources* 25, no. 3 (2012): 217-34.
- Bauman, Whitney, Richard Bohannon, and Kevin O'Brien. *Grounding Religion: A Field Guide to the Study of Religion and Ecology*. Hoboken: Taylor & Francis, 2010.
- Bauman, Whitney. "Ecology and Contemporary Christian Theology." *Religion Compass* 5, no. 8 (2011): 376-88.
- Bona, Maria Fatima. "Peringati Hari Perdamaian Dunia, Tokoh Lintas Agama Deklarasi Siaga Bumi." *Berita Satu*. September 15, 2015. <https://www.beritasatu.com/kesra/308682-peringati-hari-perdamaian-dunia-tokoh-lintas-agama-deklarasi-siaga-bumi.html>.
- Cheng, Chin-Fa. "Environmental Ontology in Deep Ecology and Mahayana Buddhism." *Environmental Ethics* 38, no. 2 (2016): 145-63.
- Christensen, Jan Erik. "Confucianism, Food, and Sustainability." *Asian Philosophy* 27, no. 1 (2017): 16-29.
- Collins Dictionary. "Definition of 'ecology'." Accessed 18 April, 2019. <https://www.collinsdictionary.com/dictionary/english/ecology>.
- Deane-Drummond, Celia. *Eco-Theology*. London: Darton, Longman Todd, 2008.
- Deller, Steven C, Tessa Conroy, and Bjorn Markeson. "Social Capital, Religion and Small Business Activity." *Journal of*

- Economic Behavior and Organization* 155 (2018): 365–81.
- Edington, John M.. *Indigenous Environmental Knowledge: Reappraisal*. Life Sciences. Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2017. <https://www.springer.com/gp/book/9783319624907>.
- Fukuyama, Francis. “Social Capital, Civil Society and Development.” *Third World Quarterly* 22, no. 1 (2001): 7–20.
- Gade, Anna M. “Islamic Law and the Environment in Indonesia.” *Worldviews: Global Religions, Culture, and Ecology* 19, no. 2 (2015): 161–83.
- Gerten, Dieter, and Sigurd Bergmann, eds. *Religion in Environmental and Climate Change: Suffering, Values, Lifestyles*. Paperback ed. London: Bloomsbury, 2013.
- Gottlieb, Roger S. *The Oxford Handbook of Religion and Ecology*. Oxford Handbooks. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006. 2006. Accessed April 25, 2019. <http://www.oxfordhandbooks.com.ru.idm.oclc.org/view/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780195178722.001.0001/oxfordhb-9780195178722>.
- Gottlieb, Roger S. *This Sacred Earth: Religion, Nature, Environment*. 2nd ed. Issr Library. New York: Routledge, 2004.
- Gouldson, Andrew, and Peter W Roberts. *Integrating Environment and Economy: Strategies for Local and Regional Government*. London: Routledge, 2002.
- GreenChristian. “About: Ordinary Christians, Extraordinary

Times.” Accessed April 23, 2019, <https://greenchristian.org.uk/connect/about/>.

Hadiwitanto, Handi. *Religion and Generalised Trust: An Empirical-Theological Study among University Students in Indonesia*. PhD diss., 2016. Lit Verlag, 2016.

Herdiansyah, Herdis, Trisasono Jokopitoyo, and Ahmad Munir. “Environmental Awareness to Realizing Green Islamic Boarding School (eco-Pesantren) in Indonesia.” *Iop Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science* 30 (2016): 1-7.

Holden W.N, and Mansfield W.O. “Laudato Si: A Scientifically Informed Church of the Poor Confronts Climate Change.” *Worldviews: Environment, Culture, Religion* 22, no. 1 (2018): 28-55.

Hopkins, Nick. “Religion and Social Capital: Identity Matters.” *Journal of Community & Applied Social Psychology* 21 (2011): 528-540.

Hussein Fatimah. “Youth Expressions of Religiosity Through Dialogue in Indonesia.” *International Journal of Interreligious and Intercultural Studies* 2, no. 2 (2019): 1-17.

Innes, Judith E. “Consensus Building: Clarifications for the Critics.” *Planning Theory* 3, no. 1 (2004): 5-20.

Kementerian Agama RI. “Data Umat Berdasar Jumlah Pemeluk Agama Menurut Agama.” Accessed 15 September, 2021. <https://data.kemenag.go.id/agamadaashboard/statistik/umat#>.

- Keown, D. "Buddhism and Ecology: A Virtue Ethics Approach." *Contemporary Buddhism* 8, no. 2 (2007): 97-112.
- Khamis, Reem. "Repercussions of French rioting on climate change." *An-Nahar*. December 6, 2018. <https://en.annahar.com/article/911080-the-repercussions-of-french-rioting-on-the-rapid-increase-of-climate-change>.
- Kimbrough, Liz. "Religious leaders mobilize to protect indigenous people and forests." *Mongabay*. May 2, 2018. <https://news.mongabay.com/2018/05/religious-leaders-mobilize-to-protect-indigenous-people-and-forests/>.
- Lee C. , and Han L. "Recycling Bodhisattva: The Tzu-Chi Movement's Response to Global Climate Change." *Social Compass* 62, no. 3 (2015): 311-25.
- Lindsey, Timothy, Helen Pausacker, and Charles A. Coppel. *Chinese Indonesians: Remembering, Distorting, Forgetting*. Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 2005.
- Maarif, Samsul. "Indigenous Religion Paradigm: Re-interpreting Religious Practices of Indigenous People," *Studies in Philosophy* 44 (2019): 103-121.
- Madinier, Remy. *Islam and Politics in Indonesia: The Masyumi Party between Democracy and Integralism*. Translated by Jeremy Desmond. Singapore: NUS Press, 2015. <https://www-jstor-org.ru.idm.oclc.org/stable/j.=excelsior%3A96092e18a7be23ba30d1cc24e9a13767&seq=4#metada>

ta_info_tab_contents.

Mangunjaya, Fachruddin Majeri, and Jeanne Elizabeth McKay. "Reviving an Islamic Approach for Environmental Conservation in Indonesia." *Worldviews* 16, no. 3 (2012): 286-305.

Mangunjaya, Fachruddin Majeri, Imran S.L Tobing, Andang Binawan, Evangeline Pua, and Made Nurbawa. "Faiths from the Archipelago: Action on the Environment and Climate Change." *Worldviews* 19, no. 2 (2015): 103-22.

Meiners, Roger E, and Bruce Yandle. *Taking the Environment Seriously. The Political Economy Forum*. Lanham, Md.: Rowman & Littlefield, 1993.

Monggo. "The spirit of Monggo." Accessed 25 April, 2019. <http://chocolatemonggo.com/about-monggo/>.

Morgan, Brihannala. "1300 people protest for land rights, against Toba Pulp Lestari in Indonesia!" *Rainforest Action Network*. Accessed 25 April, 2019. https://www.ran.org/the-understory/tpl_landrights_protest/.

Pam Nilan, "Indonesian Youth, Global Environmentalism and Transnational Mining," *Youth and Globalization* 1, No. 1 (2019): 166-186.

Pihkala, Panu. "Rediscovery of Early Twentieth-Century Ecotheology." *Open Theology* 2, no. 1 (2016): 268-285.

Pimm, Stuart L, Robert Leo Smith. "Ecology." Accessed April 18, 2019. <https://www.britannica.com/science/ecology>.

- Putri, Primi Suharmadhi, "Re-Claiming Lost Possessions: A Study of the Javanese Samin (Sedulur Sikep) Movement to maintain their Peasant Identity and Access to Resources." Master Thesis., University of Oslo, 2017.
- Qantara. "Appealing to Indonesia's Muslims." Accessed April 23, 2019. <https://en.qantara.de/content/islam-and-single-use-plastics-appealing-to-indonesias-muslims>.
- Reuter, Thomas A. "The Green Revolution in the World's Religions: Indonesian Examples in International Comparison." *Religions* 6, no. 4 (2015): 1217-231.
- Ropi, Ismatu. *Religion and Regulation in Indonesia*. Singapore: Palgrave Macmillan, 2017. <https://www.palgrave.com/gp/book/9789811028267>.
- Roshayanti F, Wicaksono A.G.C, Minarti I.B, and International Conference on Mathematics and Science Education 2018 ICMSce 2018. "How Indonesian Students Think About Environment: Case Study at North Coastal Central Java, Indonesia." *Journal of Physics: Conference Series* 1157, no. 2 (2019).
- Sapiie, Marguerite Afra. "Constitutional Court rules indigenous faiths 'acknowledged' by state." *The Jakarta Post*. November 7, 2017. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2017/11/07/constitutional-court-rules-indigenous-faiths-acknowledged-by-state.html>.
- Schilderman, J.B.A.M. "Defining Religion. a Humanities Perspective." *Journal of Empirical Theology* 27 (2014): 176-98.

Sheherazade, and Susan M Tsang. "Quantifying the Bat Bushmeat Trade in North Sulawesi, Indonesia, with Suggestions for Conservation Action." *Global Ecology and Conservation* 3 (2015): 324-30.

Stump, J. B, and Alan G Padgett. *The Blackwell Companion to Science and Christianity*. Chichester, West Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell, 2012. <https://onlinelibrary-wiley-com.ru.idm.oclc.org/doi/book/10.1002/9781118241455>.

Suherdjoko. "Kendeng farmers blockade cement factory." *The Jakarta Post*. February 11, 2017. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2017/02/11/kendeng-farmers-blockade-cement-factory.html>.

Suryakusuma, Julia. "Religious Affairs Ministry: White elephant or political necessity?" *The Jakarta Post*, June 23, 2017. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/academia/2016/06/23/religious-affairs-ministry-white-elephant-or-political-necessity.html>.

Sutari,Tiara. "Ganjar dan Sudirman Ditantang Bernyali Bahas Semen Kendeng." *CNN Indonesia*. June 5, 2018. <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/pilkadaserentak/nasional/20180503071647-32-295292/ganjar-dan-sudirman-ditantang-bernyali-bahas-semen-kendeng>.

The Forum on Religion and Ecology at Yale. "Religious leaders join interfaith rainforest initiative *Interfaith Rainforest Initiative* in Oslo today." Accessed April 23, 2019. <http://fore.yale.edu/news/item/religious-leaders-join-interfaith-rainforest-initiative-in-oslo-today/>.

Tzu Chi. "Tzu Chi Partners with the Largest Islamic Organisation in Indonesia." Accessed 25 April, 2019. <https://www.tzuchi.org.sg/en/news-and-stories/global-presence/tzu-chi-partners-with-the-largest-islamic-organisation-in-indonesia/>.

United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change. "The Paris Agreement." Last modified October 22, 2018. <https://unfccc.int/process-and-meetings/the-paris-agreement/the-paris-agreement>.

Vaezi, Mahmood. "The Role of Interreligious Dialogues on Religious Tolerance." *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies* 74, no. 3 (2018).

Vatican. "Encyclical Letter 'Laudato Si' of the Holy Father Francis on Care for our Common Home." Accessed April 23, 2019. http://w2.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/encyclicals/documents/papa-francesco_20150524_enciclica-laudato-si.html.

Wan Sabri Wan Yusof, and Arfah Ab Majid. "Inter-Religious Dialogue Models in Malaysia." *Global Journal Al-Thaqafah* 2, no. 1 (2012): 7-13.

Weller, Paul. "State(s), and Society(ies): with Particular Reference to the United Kingdom and the European Union." *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 6, no. 2 (2005): 271-289.

Werntz, Kathryn M. "Indonesia's fatwa shows religious duty can be a route to sustainable behaviour." *The Guardian*, March 24, 2014. <https://www.theguardian.com/>

sustainable-business/religion-environment-wildlife-trafficking-indonesia-fatwa-sustainable.

Whitten, Tony, Roehayat Emon Soeriaatmadja, and Suraya A. Afiff. *The Ecology of Java and Bali*. The Ecology of Indonesia Series, V. 2. Hong Kong: Periplus Editions, 1996.

Williams, Lewis, Rose Alene Roberts, and Alastair McIntosh. *Radical Human Ecology: Intercultural and Indigenous Approaches*. Farnham, Surrey, England: Ashgate Pub. Company, 2011. <https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.ru.idm.oclc.org/lib/ubnru-ebooks/reader.action?docID=823561&ppg=21#>.

ABOUT AUTHOR

Daan van der Leij is MA Student Religion and Policy at Radboud University. During his two months internship at CRCS UGM, Daan wrote a literature report on environmental debates in Indonesia in which religious groups play an active role.

RELIGION occupies a central topic within the public debates in Indonesia, including the issue of ecology. Hence, the role of religion in Indonesia in overcoming the ecological crisis is vital: not only because of Indonesia's environmental conditions that are prone to ecological disasters, but also the the influence of religious institutions that are so prominent in this country. Many religious leaders in Indonesia engage to the issues in various ways: from initiating a moral movement, providing religious teaching or interpretation that more eco-friendly, up to mobilizing political activism in the field. These responses could be considered as a form of responsibility for ecological sustainability.

The literature review conducted by Daan is written in this context, namely how religion and interreligious dialogue in Indonesia respond to the ecological crisis surround it. Daan describes the basic academic concepts of ecology as it relates to social and cultural theory. These concepts may serve as a framework to see the possibilities of ecology becoming the main issue in interreligious dialogue and practice in Indonesia. For extend, the framework help us to have better understanding on how interreligious values can be relevant to advocate against the current environmental issues in Indonesia.



UNIVERSITAS GADJAH MADA
SEKOLAH PASCASARJANA
PROGRAM STUDI AGAMA
DAN LINTAS BUDAYA

ISBN 978-623-7289-13-5

